



ARMENOPHOBIA
IN
AZERBAIJAN
ORGANIZED
HATE SPEECH
&
ANIMOSITY
TOWARDS
ARMENIANS



THE OFFICE OF OMBUDSMAN OF THE REPUBLIC OF ARTSAKH

ARMENOPHOBIA
IN
AZERBAIJAN
ORGANIZED
HATE SPEECH
&
ANIMOSITY
TOWARDS
ARMENIANS

IN COOPERATION WITH
T U F E N K I A N
FOUNDATION

CONTRIBUTING EXPERTS



Anzhela Elibegova
Expert on Azerbaijani
Studies



Levon Gevorgyan
Legal expert



Yeghishe Kirakosyan
Legal expert

1. Introduction

Since the 2016 April War, the Office of the Nagorno Karabakh Ombudsman has undertaken to document the rise and unprecedented level of anti-Armenian rhetoric that has sadly become part of the mainstream discourse in Azerbaijan today. This report presents the second series of findings from the on-going documentation efforts. In doing so, this report exposes a worrying trend of extremist Armenophobia in all segments of Azerbaijani society. More worrying still is the lack of international attention and condemnation at this growing trend.

As the following pages illustrate, extreme Armenophobia has become normalized in an increasingly authoritarian Azerbaijan. It is perhaps no coincidence that this disturbing rise in Armenophobia has gone hand in hand with systematic repressions on much of Azerbaijan's budding independent civil society. Indeed, as this report documents, anti-Armenian sentiment has become an integral factor in the crackdowns, with pro-democracy dissidents being accused of having Armenian ancestry or part of a wider Armenian conspiracy against the Azerbaijani state. The infamous trope of the Armenians as a convenient scapegoat for domestic political opposition harkens back to the dark days of Nazi Germany.

The report is organized as follows: Chapter 2 documents instances of Armenophobia among state officials and non-state public figures, as well as anti-Armenian elements present in educational material for primary and secondary schools. Great care has been taken to include original citations of all instances and attributable quotes, which can be found throughout the document's extensive footnotes. Based on these citations as evidence, Chapter 3 considers Armenophobia within the context of international law and presents its resulting violations.

2. Documented Instances of Armenophobia in Azerbaijan

2.1 Statements Attributed to High-Ranking Officials

Azerbaijani state officials at the highest level have frequently been involved in fuelling anti-Armenian xenophobia and hatred, glorifying murderers of Armenians, and contributing to the increase of the divide between the two nations.

Ilham Aliyev, President of Azerbaijan

Below are a number of statements made by Ilham Aliyev, the President of Azerbaijan, during his official appearances and in his public statements and addresses. Most statements are published on the official webpage of the President of Azerbaijan and in other official sources.

“Armenian fascism has brought great misfortunes. Innocent people are still suffering from the Armenian policy.”¹

“If you do not want to die, then get out of Azerbaijani lands. [...] We must and we do wage a more active struggle with Armenia. We have isolated it from all international and regional projects.”²

Some of the statements are also implicit or explicit threats of military operations:

“If the Armenian fascist state does not give up its dirty deeds, the very existence of the Armenian state can be called into question.”³

“Of course, our lands were occupied as a result of foreign intervention.

¹ “Speech by Ilham Aliyev at the opening of the Fifth Baku International Humanitarian Forum”, President.az, 29 September 2016, accessed February 10, 2018: <http://en.president.az/articles/21234>

² “Ilham Aliyev chaired the meeting of the Cabinet of Ministers dedicated to the results of socioeconomic development in the first quarter of 2015 and objectives for the future”, President.az, 10 April 2015, accessed February 10, 2018: <http://en.president.az/articles/14805>

³ “President and Supreme Commander-in-Chief Ilham Aliyev visited a military unit in Agdam”, President.az, 6 August 2014, accessed February 10, 2018: <http://en.president.az/articles/12487>

*This is the truth. Everybody knows that. You know this very well, I know this, our children also need to know this and all the people should know this.*⁴

Another direction of such statements is aimed at creating an image of an anti-Azerbaijani Armenian lobby, which allegedly conspires to damage or undermine the Azerbaijani statehood:

*“Our political weight and economic power are growing. [...] Still, there are ill-wishing forces who do not love us. They can be divided into several groups. First, our main enemies are the Armenians from all over the world and the hypocritical, corrupt and bribe-taker politicians who are under their influence.”*⁵

Azerbaijani official sources also frequently publish anti-Armenian statements made by private individuals and politicians in their addresses to the President of Azerbaijan.

[excerpts from letters to Ilham Aliev]

*Asker Bayramov: “I am asking you to send me to battle, too... I will go to kill them rather than to die. Please do not turn down my request.”*⁶

*Ahmed Akoji: “The despicable Armenians will see the inextinguishable power of the Turkic people. May Allah protect you. May the Almighty be by your side.”*⁷

*Byulent Karagan: “We always support you in your just struggle against the hateful Armenians.”*⁸

*Yusif Rzayev: “Under your leadership, our army will drive off the Armenian fascists from all the occupied territories and will take our revenge.”*⁹

*Zamiga Akhadova: “The devious Armenians saw what the fed-up Azerbaijani soldiers are capable of.”*¹⁰

The general tone and mood of the anti-Armenian statements of the Azer-

4 “Ilham Aliyev reviewed a new residential settlement built for 1,500 IDP families in Ganja”, President.az, 21 January 2014, accessed February 10, 2018: <http://en.president.az/articles/10852>

5 “Ilham Aliyev’s final speech at a conference dedicated to the outcomes of the third year of implementation of State Program on socio-economic development of regions of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2009-2013”, President.az, 28 February 2012, accessed February 10, 2018: <http://ru.president.az/articles/4400>

6 “Письма Президенту Ильхаму Алиеву: Мы Все Как Один Поддерживаем Ваш Политический Курс И Нашу Армию - ОБНОВЛЕНО”, Day.Az, 11 April 2016, accessed February 10, 2018: <http://news.day.az/politics/767018.html>

7 Ibid.

8 “От Бюлента Карагана, Стамбул, Турция”, President.az, 6 April 2016, accessed February 10, 2018: <http://ru.president.az/articles/18570>

9 “От Юсифа Раева, Баку, Азербайджан”, President.az, 6 April 2016, accessed February 10, 2018: <http://ru.president.az/articles/18528>

10 “От Земига Ахадова, Лерик, Азербайджан”, President.az, 6 April 2016, accessed February 10, 2018: <http://ru.president.az/articles/18631>

bajjani President has also been captured and documented by the international media:

Al Jazeera:

“In a series of tweets Monday, Azerbaijani President Ilham Aliyev didn’t mince words when expressing his views on neighbouring Armenia”.¹¹ “Since hostilities broke out, President Aliyev took to Twitter to threaten war, while calling Armenians “barbarians and vandals.”¹²

Zakir Hasanov, Minister of Defence

The tone and the style of anti-Armenian statements has also been adopted by Mr. Zakir Hasanov, the Minister of Defence of Azerbaijan and the official statements of the Ministry as such:

“It’s pretty hard to be speaking here today. But we have to tell the truth. Armenian fascists have been committing crimes against us for hundreds of years. Had this crime not been stopped, it would be continuous.”¹³

“As the situation become tense on the frontline, citizens wishing to go to war appeal to the Defense Ministry. It arises from our people’s hatred for the enemy [Armenians] and wishes to liberate our lands.”¹⁴

From a 4 April 2016 order of **Minster of Defence**:

“...Minister of Defense ordered to be ready to launch destructive strikes by all means of Armed Forces, including rocket artillery forces, to the Khankendi district [Stepanakert, capital of Nagorno Karabakh] and other occupied territories of Azerbaijan...”¹⁵

Other High-Ranking Officials

Anti-Armenian statements of other high-ranking Azerbaijani officials further contribute to the fostering and ingraining of animosity and hatred towards Armenians in the everyday life of the Azerbaijan’s population.

Executive

Ramiz Mehdiyev, Head of Presidential Administration:

“Relying on the Armenians” spirituality, on the belief that they will be grateful, Azerbaijan yielded the city of Irevan to them as a capital (a

11 “Azerbaijan President: ‘Armenia Is Powerless’”, The Stream - Al Jazeera English, 14 January 2015, accessed February 10, 2018: <http://stream.aljazeera.com/story/201501140126-0024487>

12 “President of Azerbaijan fires provocative tweets during conflict”, The Stream - Al Jazeera English, 7 August 2014, accessed February 10, 2018: <http://stream.aljazeera.com/story/201408071254-0024028>

13 “Azerbaijani defense minister vows to avenge martyrs”, Apa.az, 11 April 2016, accessed February 10, 2018: <http://en.apa.az/azerbaijan-military/azerbaijan-army-azerbaijani-armed-forces/azerbaijani-defense-minister-vows-to-avenge-martyrs.html>

14 Ibid.

15 “Order of Minster of Defense to Armed Forces”, Mod.gov.az, 4 April 2016, accessed February 10, 2018: <http://mod.gov.az/en/news/order-of-minster-of-defense-to-armed-forces-12748.html>

political centre) for the state, which was being created for them. [...] the aggressiveness towards the neighbours has been one of the methods the politicians have implemented to hold the power over the people throughout the history of the hay people.”¹⁶

Novruz Mammadov, Deputy Head of Presidential Administration:

“Using hypocrisy and flattering manners, the Armenians have created a position for themselves in all the countries. And from there, they are telling the Armenians at home, “Be stronger, be patriotic.”¹⁷

Ali M. Hasanov, Assistant to the President of Azerbaijan for Public and Political Issues:

“Neighbouring countries normally contribute to each other’s development. Being neighbours with the Armenians, however, has created only problems for us and a threat for our security and culture. Moreover, genocide was perpetrated against the Azerbaijani people. It is our geopolitical task to protect our history, culture, physical existence and further development from the Armenians.”¹⁸

Ali S. Hasanov, Deputy Prime Minister, Chairman of the State Committee for Deals of Refugees and IDPs:

“Russia should know that the Armenians who betrayed the USSR and spied against it during the World War II will do the same against Russia one day, as well. The West is also aware of this. It is sometimes held that this kind of statements should not be made against a whole nation but it is allowed when it comes to the Armenians. [...] The time of groaning has passed. Now it is time to prepare our youngsters to liberate our lands.”¹⁹

“Over the past 15 years, 1.5 million Armenians have left Armenia. These are the Armenians who have a little common sense, awareness and money in their pocket. Everyone left in Armenia is miserable and incapable to work. The Armenians in Nagorno Karabakh are forced to stay there with the use of weapon. They are somehow held there at the expense of grants. Would a normal Armenian live there? They indeed know that it is an Azerbaijani territory and that the Azerbaijanis will go back there sooner or later. They need to think about their future, about the children. They have been brought here from somewhere else, which means they were refugees. They will become refugees for a second

¹⁶ “Рамиз Мехтиев. Нагорно-Карабахский Конфликт В Контексте Гражданского Общества Армении”, 1news.az, 30 November 2016, accessed February 11, 2018: <http://www.1news.az/politics/20161130124721754.html>

¹⁷ “Новруз Мамедов: Мы усиливаем армию и оставляем за собой право освободить свои территории”, 1news.az, 12 November 2016, accessed February 11, 2018: <http://www.1news.az/politics/20161112035940988.html>

¹⁸ “Соседство С Армянами Представляет Угрозу”, Novosti.az, 22 December 2016, accessed February 11, 2018: <http://novosti.az/karabakh/4925.html>

¹⁹ “Али Гасанов: “Время стенаний позади””, Anspress.com, 2 April 2014, accessed February 11, 2018: <http://www.anspress.com/siyaset/02-04-2014/ali-gasanov-vremya-stenaniy-pozadi>

time in the future.”²⁰

“The Soviet troops, the overwhelming majority of the personnel of which were Armenians, occupied Baku in 1990 and committed an unprecedented massacre of the peaceful citizens of Azerbaijan.”²¹

Abulfas Garayev, Minister of Culture and Tourism:

“As long as the Azerbaijani people and the Azerbaijani culture exist, we will be exposed to the Armenian plagiarism.”²²

Elnur Aslanov, Head of the Political Analysis and Information Department of the Presidential Administration:

“Armenia has turned into “a cancer tumour” on the region.”²³

“The organisation, which reported two months ago that the presidential elections will be rigged in Azerbaijan, not only expresses its lack of seriousness and professionalism, but also points out the fact that it is fulfilling a specific order. It is not accidental that a number of Armenian Diaspora organisations act as partner of Human Rights House. An Armenian called Saro Saroyan is in charge of financial affairs at the secretariat of the organisation.”²⁴

Eldar Sabiroglu, Colonel, Head of Defence Ministry Press Service:

“They even unscrupulously accuse us of provocation. What is their aim? It is clear that the insidious enemy attempts to create a misleading opinion among the Azerbaijani public by this way. The lie is in their blood.”²⁵

Legislative

Oqtay Asadov, Chairman of the Parliament:

“Over the past century, the Armenians have killed around 2 million Azerbaijani and Turkic people. The perpetrators of these murders were

²⁰ “Али Гасанов: «Все Армяне, Имеющие Ум, Сознание И Деньги В Кармане, Покидают Армению»”, Ara.az, 27 May 2011, accessed February 11, 2018: <http://ru.apa.az/politika-azerbaydjana/vnutrennyaya-politika/ali-gasanov-vse-armyane-imeyushie-um-soznanie-i-dengi-v-karmane-pokidayut-armeniyu-.html>

²¹ “Əli Həsənov Erməni Lobbisindən Şikayətəndi”, Pia.az, 17 December 2013, accessed February 11, 2018: http://pia.az/Eli_Hesenov_ermeni_lobbisinden_-12149-xeber.html#.UrGKuOXkFDQ

²² “Абульфас Караев: «Пока Есть Азербайджанская Культура, Мы Будем Подвержены Армянскому Плагиату»”, Vesti.az, 15 November 2011, accessed February 11, 2018: <http://vesti.az/news/96352/news.php?id=117584>

²³ “Эльнур Асланов: “Армения - Раковая Опухоль Южного Кавказа” - ОБНОВЛЕНО”, Day.az, 17 May 2013, accessed February 11, 2018: <https://news.day.az/politics/402615.html>

²⁴ “Azerbaijani Presidential Administration: Human Rights House Network Is Fulfilling Order”, Apa.az, 22 August 2013, accessed February 10, 2018: <http://en.apa.az/azerbaijan-politics/foreign-news/azerbaijani-presidential-administration-human-rights-house-network-is-fulfilling-order.html>

²⁵ “Эльдар Сабироглу Выразил Отношение К Заявлению Минобороны Армении”, Ara.az, 11 April 2013, accessed February 11, 2018: <http://ru.apa.az/news/245115>

| *the Armenian nationalists.*"²⁶

Ziyafat Asgarov, First Deputy Speaker of Parliament:

*"According to him, it is difficult to treat "Armenian disease": "Unless this disease is not treated, its complications gradually become more serious and it will harm only Armenians. The so-called genocide is groundless from historical, legal or spiritual point of view. Simply, Armenians live with this fantasy and disease. The reason for this is their territorial claims against the neighbouring countries – Azerbaijan, Georgia, Turkey and even Russia, though it is Russia that is supporting Armenia."*²⁷

Elman Mammadov, MP:

*"Why does Turkey still tolerate the Armenians on its land? For what reason does it hold them? Turkey could rather be a country without Armenians. <...> Turkey and Azerbaijan could together wipe Armenia off the face of the Earth at a blow, and the Armenians should beware of that thought. <...> Why does Turkey create favourable conditions for the Armenians" enrichment? Turkey, exile them at last from your territory, and let them draw conclusions from that!"*²⁸

Siyavush Novruzov, Deputy Executive Secretary of the Ruling "Yeni Azerbaijan" Party (YAP):

*"We do not allow Armenians into our party. Applications of the sort have been submitted to the party's regional and city offices; they were rejected, however. There is not a single Armenian among the YAP members."*²⁹

Statements and actions surrounding the Ramil Safarov incident

When Ramil Safarov brutally murdered an Armenian officer – Gurban Margaryan – in his sleep, during the night of February 19, 2004 in Budapest, where both officers were attending a NATO English-language seminar, Azerbaijani state officials praised the actions of the murderer. Furthermore, Azerbaijan went as far as to pardon the criminal and grant him a hero's welcome after his extradition from Hungary.

²⁶ "Оттай Асадов: «За последнее столетие армяне убили около двух миллионов азербайджанцев и турок»", Vesti.az, 24 February 2012, accessed February 11, 2018: <http://vesti.az/news/108181>

²⁷ "Ziyafat Asgarov: "Armenia Is Among Unpromising Countries""", Apa.az, 16 April 2013, accessed February 11, 2018: <http://en.apa.az/azerbaijan-politics/foreign-news/ziyafat-asgarov-armenia-is-among-unpromising-countries.html>.

²⁸ The original source in Moderator.az (<http://moderator.az/index.php?xeber=76314>) is not accessible any more. Cited in: "Azerbaijani MP urges Turkish Government to expel all Armenians", Panorama.am, 28 April 2015, accessed February 10, 2018: <http://www.panorama.am/en/news/2015/04/28/azerbaijan-mamedov/63511>.

²⁹ "Siyavuş Novruzovdan daha bir sensasiya", Moderator.az, 15 February 2013, accessed February 10, 2018: <http://moderator.az/haber-siyavu-novruzovdan-daha-bir-sensasiya-t2752.html>

As one Azerbaijani news source indicates, **Novruz Mammadov**, Head of the foreign relations department of Azerbaijan's Presidential Administration, made the following statement yet in 2012, immediately after Safarov's extradition to and release by Azerbaijan:

*"It is very touching to see this son of the homeland, which was thrown in jail after he defended his country's honor and dignity of the people" and noted that "Azerbaijani President Ilham Aliyev signed an order to pardon Ramil Safarov, as soon as he set foot in Azerbaijan. The Head of State once again proved that he is the President of every citizen of the country".*³⁰

According to another news source, **Elnur Aslanov**, Chief of the Political Analysis and Information Department of Azerbaijan's Presidential Administration, was reported making the following statement back in 2011:

*"The victory at the Eurovision-2011 song contest, the success of our sportsmen in the international tournaments, heroes as Mubariz Ibrahimov and Ramil Safarov with their bravery brought the second breath to the Azerbaijani society and people".*³¹

Furthermore, a special section was set on the webpage of the President of Azerbaijan, labeled "Letters of Appreciation regarding Ramil Safarov," where individuals can refer their congratulations for the release and pardon of the convicted criminal.³²

Another matter receiving broad coverage in the Azerbaijani media is the welcome granted to Ramil Safarov by the ombudsman of the Republic of Azerbaijan – Elmira Suleymanova – who expressed gratitude to the President of Azerbaijan for the efforts in extradition and pardoning of criminal.³³ Notably, the Ombudsman reportedly stated in 2004: "Safarov must become an example of patriotism for the Azerbaijani youth."³⁴

Agshin Mehdiyev – former Permanent Representative of Azerbaijan to the Council of Europe and former Permanent Representative to the United Nations – was reported indicating after the murder of Gurban Margaryan that he does not advise Armenians to sleep safely until the Karabakh conflict is settled and that until then incidents like in Budapest cannot be ruled out.³⁵

³⁰ "Agreement During Hungarian Premier's Visit Decisive In Ramil Safarov's Issue", News.az, 1 September, 2012, accessed February 11, 2018: <http://news.az/articles/67397/print>

³¹ "Department Chief Of Presidential Administration Elnur Aslanov: "Mubariz Ibrahimov And Ramil Safarov Brought Second Breath To Azerbaijan""", Apa.az, 26 August 2011, accessed February 11, 2018: <http://en.apa.az/azerbaijani-news/social-news/department-chief-of-presidential-administration-elnur-aslanov-mubariz-ibrahimov-and-ramil-safarov-brought-second-breath-to-azerbaijan.html>

³² The page was available at http://en.president.az/letters/ramil_safarov/

³³ "Ombudsman Elmira Süleymanova Ramil Səfərovlə Görüşüb", [translation from Azerbaijani: The Ombudsman met with Ramil Safarov] Apa.az, 1 September 2012, accessed February 11, 2018: <http://apa.az/xeber-az/hadise/ombudsman-elmira-suleymanova-ramil-seferovla-gorusub.html>; "Ombudsman Ramil Səfərovlə Görüşüb", Trend.az, 1 September, 2012, accessed February 11, 2018: <https://az.trend.az/azerbaijan/society/2060916.html>

³⁴ Azerbaijani newspaper "Zerkalo", issue of 28 February 2004, cited in "Information To The Statement, By Ms.Karine Soudjian From Armenian MFA, On 'Anti-Armenian propaganda and hate dissemination carried out by Azerbaijan as a serious obstacle to the negotiation process' | OSCE", Osce.org, 7 October 2008, accessed February 11, 2018: <http://www.osce.org/odihr/34195>, footnote 2.

³⁵ Ibid.

Another matter meriting coverage by the Azerbaijani news sources was that on the very first day of his return to Azerbaijan, Safarov went “to lay flowers at the tomb of Azerbaijan’s national leader, founder and architect of modern Azerbaijani state Heydar Aliyev”³⁶, showing and highlighting the apparent link between the criminal and the State of Azerbaijan.

2.2 Statements by Non-State Public Figures

Similar to the incumbent state officials, expressions of anti-Armenia xenophobia are ample in statements of public personalities, such as former government officials, businessmen, professors, journalists etc. Below are some noticeable examples mostly with alphabetic sequence:

Sheikh-ul-Islam Allahshukur Pashazadeh, Chairman of Caucasus Muslims Board:

*“We do everything possible to settle the conflict peacefully. [...] However, we do not see outcomes of these meetings because the lie and unfaithfulness are in the Armenians” blood. They sat at our table and ate our bread but as they went out to the streets, they started talking against us.”*¹

*“I am fighting against the Armenians. Accordingly, I will also have to fight against the internal Armenians, as I can find no other name for those writing stuff like that.”*²

Amrali Ismailov, Scholar:

“As a result of the way of life established throughout the history as well as of the inherited gypsy habits of snatching in any way possible and shamming the whole day long, the ungratefulness of a separate person, of a separate citizen towards another person, another citizen is nothing else than a display of a nation-wide or specifically national trait on the level of a group or of an individual, on the level of a separate representative of the nation. If an Armenian does not lie, than it is not an Armenian before you. The Armenians lie, sham, steal, betray. Despite them being cut from loathsome fabrics, there are still

³⁶ “Ramil Safarov Pays Respect To National Leader Heydar Aliyev And Azerbaijani Heroes”, Today.az, 31 August 2012, accessed February 11, 2018: <http://www.today.az/news/politics/111826.html>

¹ “Глава Духовного Управления Мусульман Кавказа: «Ложь И Предательство В Крови У Армян»”, Day.az, 22 July 2008, accessed February 12, 2018: <http://news.day.az/society/125166.html>

² “Аллахшукюр Пашазаде Воюет С Армянами И Не Занимается Бизнесом”, Day.az, 7 August 2008, accessed February 12, 2018: <http://news.day.az/society/126848.html>

*many sincere, honest and decent people in the world who believe in the Armenians, who can see also a human in an Armenian.”*³

Anar Mammadkhanov, former Azerbaijani MP:

*“I always tell our officers studying military science in Turkey, ‘You are needed in Karabakh. They [the Armenians] should be killed in Karabakh rather than in other countries.’”*⁴

Arif Gaziyev, Founder and Head of Mugam Theatre:

*“We always fought during the breaks. The school was situated not far from the river and we often truanted to gather there, sing songs and play hide-and-seek. Still, the most memorable was probably how we were throwing stones at the Armenians who were constantly trying to play some dirty trick.”*⁵

Asif Gurbanov, Chairman of World Azerbaijanis Congress

During an Azerbaijani-Turkish conference titled “The Past and the Present of the Azerbaijani-Turkish Relations and Armenia” in Izmir, Turkey:

*“The computers have virus and antivirus software. The companies creating viruses also create antiviruses. The creators of the virus called Armenia need to create its antivirus as well. To be able to achieve peace in the whole world, we need to get rid of the virus called Armenia.”*⁶

Bahram Batiyev, participant of Tekali Peace-Building Association:

*“And even though the Armenians diligently deny any kinship with jackals, their behaviour points to this. This kinship is particularly well-demonstrated in Nagorno Karabakh where a coward, mean and cunning jackal-like regime has entrenched spreading the infection (of separatism) over the whole post-Soviet area.”*⁷

Boyukagha Hajiyev, Advisor to the President of Neftchi, Azerbaijani Football Team:

*“An Azerbaijani footballer should not play under an Armenian coach’s leadership. The team needs to be changed.”*⁸

³ “Потомки Церковных Проститутки И «Котят» В Своих Грязных Делах Больше Всего Используют Русских И Россию”, 9 August 2013, accessed February 12, 2018: <http://www.vesti.az/news/168853>

⁴ “Анар Мамедханов - Армян Надо Убивать В Карабахе”, Day.az, 8 March 2004, accessed February 12, 2018: <http://news.day.az/politics/5101.html>

⁵ “Ариф Газиев: «Я С Детства Бросал Камни В Армян»”, Vesti.az, 29 June 2009, accessed February 12, 2018: <http://vesti.az/news/9522>

⁶ “Dünyada Sülh Üçün Ermənistan Adh Virusun Təmizlənməsi Lazımdır” - Asif Kurban”, Avropa.info, 24 May 2016, accessed February 10, 2018: <http://avropa.info/news/117212.html>

⁷ “«Правительство» Карабаха Выделило 46 000 Долларов На Борьбу С Себе Подобными”, Vesti.az, 9 February 2012, accessed February 12, 2018: <http://vesti.az/news/106317/news.php>

⁸ “Беюкага Гаджиев: Абышов должен покинуть Рубин, если туда назначат Минасяна”, Azerisport.com, 5 January 2014, accessed February 12, 2018: <http://www.azerisport.com/football/20140105112325025.html>

Elchin Alibeyli, Principal Producer of ATV Channel, TV-host:

*“For long years, the Armenians have been stealing Azerbaijani melodies presenting them to the international community as their own. [...] Azerbaijanis are not the only nation from whom the Armenians steal. It is their national disease. What happens is that when a nation lacks history and culture – something the Armenian historians confirm – it should shape itself at the expense of other nations. This is why they have decided to steal from their neighbours, Azerbaijanis [...]. Wherever the Armenians have lived, they have always stolen the culture and even the language of those peoples.”*⁹

Farid Teymurkhanli, Journalist:

*“The inherent meaning of the word Armenian is clear to everyone but the Armenians of course. It is meanness, it is cowardice, it is treachery. Apparently, God was in bad mood when creating them, as he has rewarded them with the most abominable qualities.”*¹⁰

Folklore Institute of Azerbaijan National Academy of Sciences:

*“The Armenians aim at sowing discord between the Azerbaijanis and the Talyshes by publishing this book, ‘Talysh Folk Legends and Fairy Tales’ is a book which appears to be nothing else than yet another expression of the Armenian insidiousness. To claim that the Talyshes and the Armenians are somehow close to each other is nothing else than a huge insult to the Talysh people. The Talysh people’s happiness and greatness is, on the contrary, that they have no relation to the Armenians.”*¹¹

Habil Aliyev, People’s Artist of Azerbaijan, Kamancha Player:

*“All of us [Azerbaijanis], including myself, have learnt to play kamancha from Armenian teachers. It happened that the art is ours, the instrument is ours yet the performers and the teachers are all Armenians [...] kamancha has been my bread [...] during the difficult post-war years when everyone was starving kamancha gave me bread and prosperity. [...] once I had to give my dear instrument – made by Armenians, by the way – to repair. The leather needed to be changed. And the Armenians deliberately increased the depth of the soundboard to spoil the sound so that I would not be able to play anymore. I was very upset [...] now I will die and there will be no one playing kamancha in Azerbaijan... again only the Armenians.”*¹²

⁹ “Об Армянской Болезни Воровства! Я Родился В Ереване... - Эльчин Алибейли В Гостях Trend Life (Видео)”, Trend.az, 23 February 2011, accessed February 12, 2018: <http://trend.az/life/interview/1834464.html>

¹⁰ “Израилю Следует Опасаться Корсунского, Добровольно Решившего Попасть В «Черный Список» МИД Азербайджана”, Vesti.az, 10 August 2013, accessed February 12, 2018: <http://www.vesti.az/news/168896>

¹¹ “Армяне на этот раз присвоили талышей”, Day.az, 4 April 2008, accessed February 12, 2018: <https://news.day.az/armenia/113505.html>

¹² “Habil Əliyev: “Ermənidən Kamança Dərsi Almışam””, Kulis.az, 22 November 2013, accessed February 12, 2018: <http://kulis.az/news/6786>

Habil Aliyev, Founder and Editor-in-Chief of Gundelik Baku Local Newspaper:

*“I consider the Armenians my eternal enemies. Wherever I see Armenians, I will cut their tongues off and will call them perverts. Even if I am torn into pieces, I will always hate them. [...] If I go to war again, I will not pity even the Armenian children.”*¹³

Hafiz Hajiyev, Modern Musavat Party Leader:

“We will assign our sons in Armenia to blow up the nuclear power plant (ANPP) there. There will be no Armenian left there then. Our neighbours can also blame us but we have to annihilate all the Armenians [...] if the Armenians do not want to live subordinating to the Azerbaijanis, they will be expelled from Karabakh [...] There should be no Armenian left in Azerbaijan.”

Earlier, the director of the Azerbaijan Centre for Political Innovations and Technologies, Mubariz Ahmedoglu, had said that Metsamor ANPP’s bombing by Azerbaijan is quite a possible act during Karabakh war, and even more efficient for the “liberation” of territories. In his turn, Azerbaijani military expert and participant of Azerbaijan’s failed aggression against the NKR, Uzeir Jafarov, had suggested “a possible riposte by the Azerbaijani troops to Metsamor ANPP.”

Moreover, the head of the Institute of Radiation Problems of Azerbaijan National Academy of Sciences, **Adil Garibov**, proposed checking Metsamor ANPP’s operational stability in extreme conditions by triggering an artificial earthquake.¹⁴

Igrar Aliyev, Director of the Institute of National Academy of Sciences:

*“Being Armenian is indeed a unique, extraordinary, malicious, misanthropic phenomenon.”*¹⁵

Jumshud Nuriyev, Azerbaijani Political Analyst, PhD in Political Science:

*“The Karabakh conflict will remain unresolved as long as people who have ‘Armenian blood in their veins’ work in state offices.” He also added that the unresolved conflict is the result of the activities of the Armenians who changed their documents.*¹⁶

Kemal Turan, Azerbaijani National-Socialist Movement Leader:

¹³ “Редактор азербайджанской газеты: Если я буду снова участвовать в войне, то даже армянских детей не пощажу”, Panorama.am, 11 February 2015, accessed February 12, 2018: <https://www.panorama.am/ru/news/2015/02/11/azerbaijan-gabil-aliyev/114958>

¹⁴ “Azerbaijani Former Presidential Candidate: We Will Blow Up Nuclear Power Plant And Slaughter All Armenians”, Panorama.am, 10 May 2016, accessed February 12, 2018: <http://www.panorama.am/en/news/2016/05/10/presidential-candidate/1576832>, referenced to “Nəzər nöqtəsi”, Anstv.ws, 4 May 2016, accessed February 12, 2018: <http://www.anstv.ws/site/video/23733-nazar-noqtasi-04-05-2016>

¹⁵ Igrar Aliyev. “False history is yet another attempt to justify aggression”, Azerbaijan National Academy of Sciences after Bakikhanov. Baku. Nurlan. 2003. p.48: <http://istoriya.az/kitablar/Ljeistoriya.pdf>

¹⁶ “Erməni Əsilli Məmurlar Öz Sənədlərini Elə Dəyişdiriblər Ki...”, Moderator.az, 5 June 2016, accessed February 12, 2018: <http://www.moderator.az/news/139750.html>

*“The Armenians are our enemies. No peace is possible with them! [...] The Armenians are not the type of a nation with whom peaceful talks could be held. They are a nation of parasites!”*¹⁷

From an interview with **Kazim Abdullayev**, the best-known and most popular Santa Claus in Azerbaijan, Honoured Artist of the Republic, who has played the role for over 30 years:

*“Kazim Muallim, if you burn a New Year tree and it really appears to be magical, what cherished dream would you bring to life?” “The dreams are many. But first of all, I would freeze the Armenians and would free Karabakh.”*¹⁸

Mubariz Ahmadoglu, Head of Centre for Political Innovations and Technologies:

*“There should be no Armenians living in Nagorno Karabakh. [...] I am not a fascist. I think the Armenians should not live in Nagorno Karabakh on the grounds of security, sovereignty and territorial integrity of Azerbaijan, as they are able to demonstrate separatist moods sooner or later again.”*¹⁹

Murad Dadashov, Honoured Artist of Azerbaijan:

*“We deal with an unhealthy society. I must confess I always pity our officials who have to deal with the Armenian side more often.”*²⁰

Rafik Aliyev, Professor:

*“Our neighbours, Armenians, imbibe the virus of national chauvinism with mother’s milk and this becomes the credo of their life. They are destined to a torturous existence because of the impossibility of getting rid of the huge amount of the trash of nationalism. They fail to find at least a little space for kind and generous ideas and impulses of joy in their soul. They pass away with hatred on their lips. Despite the religious canons, they do not ponder on the reunion with the divine while giving up their spirit. They rather think about their uncompleted “duty” of eliminating the enemy, the representative of another nation, on whose land their state is created.”*²¹

Rizvan Huseynov, Azerbaijani Expert:

“In essence, the Armenians are chameleons because they can gutlessly

¹⁷ “Интервью С Одним Из Лидеров Азербайджанского Национал–Социалистического Движения Кемаль Тураном”, Pn14.info, 7 August 2013, accessed February 12, 2018: <http://pn14.info/?p=137744>

¹⁸ “Şaxta Baba: “Erməniləri Dondurub, Qarabağı Azad Edərdim””, Kulis.az, 30 December 2013, accessed February 12, 2018: <http://kulis.az/news/7594>

¹⁹ “В Случае Возобновления Военных Действий, Поражение Армян Однозначно”, Centrasia.ru, 6 June 2008, accessed February 12, 2018: <http://www.centrasia.ru/newsA.php?st=1212743100>

²⁰ “Мурад Дадашов О Провокации Таша Саркиеня: «Мы Имеем Дело С Нездоровым Обществом»”, Day.az, 9 April 2016, accessed February 12, 2018: <http://news.day.az/politics/768394.html>

²¹ “Азербайджанский Профессор: «Если Врага Нет, То Его Следует Придумать...»”, Vesti.az, 28 August 2013, accessed February 12, 2018: <http://www.vesti.az/news/168853esti.az/news/171012>

conform to other countries” interests when it comes to words; yet they put only their own goals ahead of everything else at the same time.”²²

Samir Adigezalli, Head of the Executive Apparatus of the World Azerbaijanis Congress:

Referring to the elections of the members of the Council of State Support to Non-Governmental Organisations under the auspices of the President of Azerbaijan, said he regretted over the information about an “Armenian’s grandson” being among the candidates.

“The most awful is that there is an Armenian’s grandson among the candidates. This news must worry our entire nation. We should not give Armenians’ grandchildren the chance to hold executive positions. Some officials who support such people should be repulsed in a most serious manner.”

According to **Adigezalli**, anyone who says, “the Armenians are not the Azerbaijani’s enemies” either are the Armenian sympathizers or “were nurtured with Armenian milk.”

“All the state offices and the Azerbaijani public activists should express a stern attitude and not allow Armenians” grandchildren live in the same settlement with them. Such tolerance and humanity are a blow to our national identity and a threat to our independence.”²³

Shahin Hasanli, Imam Juma of Meshedi Dadash, a Shia Mosque in Baku:

“If someone wants to become a shehid and stand up for jihad, he needs to come to Karabakh. It is a real Kerbela here.”²⁴

Tavakkul Dadashev, Head of the Department of Expertise, Programming and Analytics of the National Television and Radio Council of Azerbaijan:

“I do not deny that offensive language is used in air and in the articles covering Armenia. It is correct and well-deserved. Every TV-channel needs to shed insults addressing Armenia as much as possible. No problem at all.”²⁵

²² “Чего добиваются армяне, проникшие в российскую элиту?”, 1news.az, 11 April 2016, accessed February 12, 2018: <http://1news.az/news/chego-dobivayutsya-armyane-pronikshie-v-rossiyskuyu-elitu>

²³ ““Erməni Xalqı ilə Azərbaycan Xalqı Düşmən Deyil” Deyənlər Erməni Sütü Əmmişlərdir”, Moderator.az, 11 March 2016, accessed February 12, 2018, <http://www.moderator.az/news/126059.html>

²⁴ “Шинитский Проповедник Призвал Молодежь Совершать Джихад В Карабахе” [“Shia preacher urges youngsters for jihad in Karabakh”], Interfax.az, 23 August 2016, accessed February 12, 2018: <http://interfax.az/view/680248>

²⁵ “In Azerbaijan They Call To Make Abusive Speeches On Air Addressed To Armenia”, Panorama.am, 6 November 2014., accessed February 11, 2018: <http://www.panorama.am/en/news/2014/11/06/azerbaijan-media/173140>

2.3 Incidents manifesting Armenophobia

Below are highlights of various incidents receiving media coverage that further demonstrate how deep the anti-Armenian xenophobic sentiments are rooted within the Azerbaijani society.

An event dedicated to Azerbaijan’s National Flag Day was held in Dashkesan on 9 November. During the event, **Ahad Abiyev**, the chief executive of Dashkesan District, broke Colombia’s schist board flag with a blow of fist confusing it with the Armenian one.¹ Abiyev, however, insisted that it was the Armenian flag painted on the board and that it was merely held upside-down. He says those claiming the broken flag was that of Colombia, “are playing in the Armenians’ hands.”

The Armenian flag was shown to the spectators instead of the Azerbaijani one during the May 13th evening broadcast of Let Them Talk, a Russian talk show. **Gafar Jabiyev**, a member of the Azerbaijani National Council, told the journalists this was a provocation that could be organised “by the Armenians working at that TV-channel to annoy the Azerbaijani audience.” He added that the lack of mistakes of that kind in favour of Azerbaijan showcases the “insidiousness of the Armenians.”²

Didaktika publishing house issued a directory on The History of Azerbaijan for university applicants in Azerbaijan. The red, blue and yellow colours of the cover page reminded the Armenian flag, which resulted in an uproar in the local media. The State Committee on Enrolment of Students issued a statement saying: “We want to inform the public that the above-mentioned

¹ Diana Monroy, “Ministro De Azerbaiyán Rompe La Bandera De Colombia” [Minister of Azerbaijan breaks the Colombian flag], Colombia.com, 10 November 2016, accessed February 13, 2018: <http://www.colombia.com/actualidad/internacionales/sdi/146375/ministro-de-azerbaiyan-rompe-la-bandera-de-colombia>

² “Нацсовет Азербайджана Заявил Об Армянской Провокации На Первом Канале”, Korrespondent.net, 16 May 2011, accessed February 13, 2018: https://korrespondent.net/business/mmedia_and_adv/1217390-nacsovet-azerbajdzhana-zayavil-ob-armyanskoj-provokacii-na-pervom-kanale

book has no relation to the State Committee on Enrolment of Students.”³

The representatives of the Armed Forces of many countries took part in a parade on the Red Square in Moscow to mark the 70th anniversary of the victory over Nazi Germany. As far as the march of the foreign countries' military contingents was organised in alphabetical order, the Armenian soldiers marched right after the Azerbaijanis. However, the Armenian flag, which could be seen behind the Azerbaijani one during the live broadcast of the Victory Day parade in Moscow, inexplicably disappeared from the photo posted on the Azerbaijani Defence Ministry website. The Defence Ministry refused to comment on the reports.⁴

Elman Abdulayev, Spokesperson for the Foreign Ministry of Azerbaijan, refused to fly with Turkish Airlines. The reason was the Agos Armenian newspapers, published in Istanbul, which were distributed in the aircrafts of the company.⁵

Arzu Geybullayeva, a journalist of Agos Turkish newspaper who has Azerbaijani origin, received a growing number of threats on social media following an interview with Azerbaijani news site modern.az. The intimidation campaign started because she had said that she was respected in the office where she worked and where many Armenians worked with her.⁶ In his article titled “Attack on the Azerbaijani Columnist of Agos Newspaper,” Fatih Gokhan, a Turkish columnist of Agos, points out the provocative questions of the Modern.az journalist, for example, “how can you work under the same roof with the enemies -- with Armenians.”

Russian pop-singer **Philip Kirkorov's** concert scheduled on 8 November 2013 in Baku, Azerbaijan, was cancelled by the host country. According to local media reports, the reason of the cancellation was that the organisers were displeased that the singer's father, Bedros Kirkorov, was helping An-drantik Aleksanyan, a 13-year-old singer from Armenia.⁷ Later, in 2016, the members of Karabakh Liberation Organisation chanted slogans in Azerbaijani and Russian “Armenian Philip, shove off!” during a concert in Baku.

Tair Imanov, head of The Planet “Guys from Baku” theatre, raised the issue of cancelling the concert of the Comedy Woman project in Baku because its founders and some of its troupe members are Armenians. Imanov expressed this claim on behalf of the whole staff of the theatre and stressed that the concert should be cancelled as Comedy Woman is “an Armenian project, is managed by the Armenians” and the whole money issued to the project would go, as he put it, into the pockets of the leadership – “into the Arme-

nians' pockets.” “No matter whether you want it or not, every Armenian who works abroad sends money to their homeland,” Imanov highlighted. Citing Azerbaijani president Ilham Aliyev, he claimed that no joint project should be carried out with the Armenians until Karabakh conflict is settled. He also reminded that “ethnic Armenians, such as Irina Allegrova” had been brought to Azerbaijan a few years ago while Allegrova's repertoire includes a song titled “My Armenia.” The Baku concert of Comedy Woman was cancelled.⁸

Azerbaijani film director and screenwriter **Ramiz Fataliyev** published an open letter demanding a ban on Soso Pavliashvili's concert in Baku because the latter was one of the first singers to visit Armenia with concerts during the NK conflict and therefore had no right to perform in Baku after that. Siyavush Karimli, the rector of Azerbaijan National Conservatory, who holds the title of People's Artist, and another People's Artist, Flora Karimova, joined him. Karimli criticised Pavliashvili's words: “I got to love Baku thanks to the Armenians.” “If Soso is so much fond of the Armenians, he'd better go and sing for them! Why has he got to go to Baku?! If that type sings in Karabakh, it is wrong to let him come to Baku and Azerbaijan as whole.” Flora Karimova also heavily criticised Soso Pavliashvili. She was especially annoyed that the singer had a concert in NKR, recognised the Armenian Genocide and called all the Armenians his brothers. “You were asking if the Azerbaijani people wanted to see you?! The Azerbaijani people spat on your face when you stepped into Karabakh!” she said.⁹

Nushiravan Magerramli, Chairman of National Television and Radio Council of Azerbaijan: The National Television and Radio Council of Azerbaijan laid claims to the managing board of ANS FM radio because of the Armenian songs constantly aired during Caucasus Top 20 musical programme. “The “Culture knows no borders” logic of ANS FM's managing board is wrong. Judging by that logic, Armenian films need to be screened in Azerbaijan, Armenian goods sold here and exhibitions of their painters organised.”¹⁰

Remish, an Azerbaijani singer holding the title of the People's Artist, was subjected to heavy criticism because of reportedly having sang in Armenian during a banquet in Russia. Etimad Asadov, the head of a public union called Karabakh Veterans, commented on the reports saying the singer needed to be deprived of his title and blocked from the broadcasts.¹¹

Irina Leparskaya, Head Coach of the Belarusian Rhythmic Gymnastics National team:

The organisers of the Rhythmic Gymnastics European Championships in Baku asked the Belarusian team not to use Armenian composer Aram Khachaturian's music during their performance. The team had

³ “Заявление ГКПС По Поводу Книги С Цветами Флага Армении На Обложке”, ВАКУ.WS - Бакинский Журнал, 1 September 2015, accessed February 13, 2018: <http://baku.ws/60634-zayavlenie-gkps-po-povodu-knigi-s-cvetami-flaga-armenii-na-oblozhke.html>

⁴ “Баку Убрал Флаг Армении С Фото Парада На Красной Площади”, ВВС Русская Служба, 11 May 2015, accessed February 13, 2018: http://www.bbc.com/russian/international/2015/05/150511_azerbaijan_armenia_tred_square_parade

⁵ “МИД Азербайджана отказывается от Французских костюмов?”, Haqqin.az, 27 February 2013, accessed February 13, 2018: <https://haqqin.az/comics/4137>

⁶ “Azerbaijan: Journalist Arzu Geybulla Threatened”, Index On Censorship, 10 October 2014, accessed February 13, 2018: <https://www.indexoncensorship.org/2014/10/azerbaijan-journalist-arzu-geybullayeva-threatened/>

⁷ “Концерт Киркорова В Баку Отменен”, РИА Новости, 25 October 2012, accessed February 13, 2018: <https://ria.ru/culture/20121025/906848449.html>

⁸ “Бакинський Концерт Армянської Труппи «Comedy Woman» Отменен”, Оху.az, 10 April 2015, accessed February 13, 2018: <https://ru.oxu.az/society/70899>

⁹ “Сиявуш Керими: Называющий Себя Мужчиной Не Станет Носить Имя Сосо”, Оху.az, 27 October 2016, accessed February 13, 2018: <http://ru.oxu.az/showbiz/156706>

¹⁰ “НСТР Выразил Претензию Руководству ANS QM”, Day.az, 2 May 2014, accessed February 14, 2018: <http://news.day.az/society/487322.html>

¹¹ “Гитарист Рямин Пожелал Кары Аллаха Тем, Кто Распространил Информацию О Том, Что Он Пел На Армянском Языке - ВИДЕО”, 1news.az, 5 January 2015, accessed February 14, 2018: <http://www.1news.az/mobile/bomond/bomaz/20150105023239843.html>

| *been performing under Khachaturian's Sabre Dance for half a year.*¹²

Russian TNT and NTV channels were not available for the Azerbaijani public on 24 April 2015, the **Armenian Genocide** centennial commemoration day, as they broadcasted films on the Armenian Genocide, baku.ws reports. According to the outlet, the Azerbaijani cable television boycotted those TV channels.¹³

In the unrecognised “Republic of Northern Cyprus” situated on the Northern part of Cyprus, Azerbaijani students created a scandal because an Armenian actor took part in a theatre play with the Turks. The Azerbaijanis were displeased because **Aret Vardanyan**, an Armenian artist, writer and actor, was playing a part in the play “Pain, Sweet Love” with Turkish actor Levant Ozdelik in the Rauf Denktaş Cultural Centre in Gazimagus district.¹⁴

Hafiz Bakhshaliyev, a former member of Azerbaijan national kickboxing team, rented a place in the centre of London in 2016 and opened a kickboxing and boxing sport club called Kavkaz. When, referring to the name Kavkaz, an Azerbaijani journalist asked him, “and if Armenians come to train there, will you accept them?” Hafiz Bakhshaliyev said, “The entry of Armenians is prohibited. We will not stand by the enemy.”¹⁵

When in September 2014 a storm pulled off numerous trees in Baku and caused serious damages to the population, the residents of Baku complained to Milli.az of the public services’ work. In response, the General Engineer of the Communal Residential Union of Khatai district **Sahin Babayev** said “the trees that are now falling on our head were planted by Armenians.” “Planting those trees back then, they created this problem for us; the pine-trees grow up, while the stems and the roots of the trees do not develop,” he said in an attempt to defend himself.¹⁶

Karabakh Liberation Organisation:

| *“We declare that if the representative of Armenia comes to Baku, our organisation will take up all the possible and impossible methods to expulse him from here and to disrupt the event of the Commonwealth of Independent States altogether.”¹⁷*

The Karabakh Liberation Organisation held a protest in front of the Flame Towers complex in Baku, where the OSCE Parliamentary Assembly Standing

Committee meeting was on. The participants expressed their protest against the participation of Armenian MPs in the meeting. Earlier, a group of activists from the organisation had held a protest against Armenian parliamentarians’ visit to Baku in the frameworks of NATO Parliamentary Assembly’s 86th Rose Roth seminar.¹⁸

Akif Nagi, head of “Karabakh Liberation Organisation” (KLO):

| *“Azerbaijan mustn’t give the Armenians an opportunity to take part in the upcoming European Games.”*

In 2011, the KLO activists got into Heydar Aliyev sport complex and started to throw stones at the Armenian sportsmen who were taking part in the World Boxing Championship. Waiting for the Armenian boxer to come out, they started yelling “Armenians, get away,” “Shame on the inviters,” “Karabakh or death” and unleashed a barrage of stones to the ring.¹⁹

Azerbaijan authorities deported **Zafer Noyan**, a Turkish athlete who had arrived in Baku to take part in European Armwrestling Championship. The reason was that Noyan was taken as an Armenian in Baku. The Turkish arm-wrestler’s assurances that he is not Armenian were of no help and he was sent back to Turkey.²⁰

Azerbaijani media “accused” a renowned lawyer **Amal Clooney** of being of an Armenian origin after she spoke about the human rights situation in Azerbaijan in an interview to BBC and about **Khadija Ismayilova**, a journalist serving a prison term on bogus charges for revealing information about the properties of the country’s ruling family.²¹

Anna Sahakyan, the beauty editor of CondeNast publishing house, who has Russian origin, was deported from Baku Airport because of her ex-husband’s surname. She was denied entry to Azerbaijan “on security grounds.” Arif Aliyev, the chairman of Yeni Nesil Party, justifies this saying that, “In case she were attacked in Azerbaijan, this would result in a huge reaction across the world.”²²

When Russian citizen **Christina Konstantinova** arrived in Baku with her 8-year-old son **Luka Vardanyan** as tourists, her documents were confiscated at the passport control and she was stopped at the customs to be told that the problem was her son’s surname and father’s name. She told them that she, Luka and her husband are Russian citizens and that Ruben Vardanyan, her husband and Luka’s father, was in Moscow at that moment. After waiting for

¹² “Сборная Беларуси по художественной гимнастике по просьбе азербайджанцев отказалась от музыки армянского композитора Арама Хачатуряна”, Tut.by, 1 June 2014, accessed February 14, 2018: <https://news.tut.by/politics/401420.html>

¹³ “На азербайджанском кабельном ТВ заблокировали каналы ТНТ и НТВ”, Baku.ws - Бакинский Журнал, 24 April 2015, accessed February 14, 2018: <http://baku.ws/54377-1na-azerbaydzhanskom-kabelnom-tv-zablokirovali-kanaly-tnt-i-ntv.html>

¹⁴ “Tələbələrimizdən Erməniyə Etiraz”, Movqe.az, 15 April 2015, accessed February 14, 2018: <http://www.movqe.az/news/sosial/52857.html>

¹⁵ “Londonda Klub Açıq İdmançımız: “Ermənilərə Giriş Qadağandır” - MÜSAHİBƏ”, Publika.az, 2 March 2016, accessed February 14, 2018: <http://publika.az/news/musahibe/127667.html>

¹⁶ “Ermənilərin əkdikləridir, aşır”, Qafqazinfo.az, 2 October 2014, accessed February 14, 2018: <http://qafqazinfo.az/news/detail/ermenilerin-ekdikleridir-asir-aciqlamafotolar-91000>

¹⁷ “Неучастие Армении в заседании глав Генштабов ВС СНГ в Баку - результат “технического сговора”: Александр Синайский”, Regnum.ru, 9 April 2014, accessed February 14, 2018: <https://regnum.ru/news/1789158.html>

¹⁸ “В Баку Делегацию Армении Вновь Встретили В Штыки”, Panorama.am, 28 June 2014, accessed February 14, 2018: <https://www.panorama.am/ru/news/2014/06/28/baku-meeting/253888>

¹⁹ “Protest in Azerbaijan against Armenian sportsmen’s arrival at European Games”, Panorama.am, 18 February 2015, accessed February 14, 2018: <https://www.panorama.am/en/news/2015/02/18/azerbaijan-meeting/110012>

²⁰ “Турецкого Спортсмена Не Пустили В Азербайджан, Приняв Его За Армянина”, Sportbox.az, 29 May 2014, accessed February 14, 2018: <http://sportbox.az/other/92955/tureckogo-sportsmena-ne-pustili-v-azerbaj-dzhan-prinyav-ego-za-armyanina>. See also: <https://www.panorama.am/ru/news/2014/05/31/noyan/275210>

²¹ “Clooneys Find Themselves Targets In Armenia And Azerbaijan’S War Of Words”, Intellinews.com, 5 May 2016, accessed February 14, 2018: <http://www.intellinews.com/caucasus-blog-clooneys-find-themselves-targets-in-armenia-and-azerbaijan-s-war-of-words-96729/>

²² Светлана Болотникова, “Расизм По-Азербайджански”, Большой Кавказ, 16 August 2013, accessed February 14, 2018: <http://www.bigcaucasus.com/events/world/16-08-2013/85496-saakyan-0/>

8 hours, they were deported from the country.²³

The case of Yunus

Leyla Yunus, a renowned Azerbaijani human rights defender, Director of the Institute of Peace and Democracy:

“My grandmother is German. Her whole family was exiled to Kazakhstan in 1941 and none of them survived. She hid her origin and maiden name her whole life. She was so strongly bounded by fear that even before death in 1986 she refused to answer my question what her mother’s name was. My husband’s mother is Armenian. She has passed away. But when she was alive, the whole family scrupulously hid her origin [...] all her life, my mother was afraid to say that her mother is German and my daughter that her grandmother is Armenian.”²⁴

Ismail Asadov, head of Baku’s Yasamal District Police, during human rights defender Leyla Yunus’ arrest:

“I will not only go to the toilet after her [the Armenian woman] but I will also kill her and drink her blood like they have done with thousands of our compatriots.” When he was objected that the circumstances were different, as there was war back then, he said Yunus must love the Azerbaijanis in the peace-time rather than “her own nation.”²⁵

Siyavush Novruzov, an Azerbaijani MP: The 10th article of the European Parliament’s resolution states that the Arif and Leyla Yunus couple was detained in Azerbaijan because they wanted to establish ties between the Armenian and Azerbaijani youth. “How can the Azerbaijani make friends with the Armenian youth?” the Azerbaijani MP wonders.²⁶

The Website **Haqqin.az** published an article accusing **Oxfam**, an international organisation specialising in poverty issues (Oxford Committee for Famine Relief), in funding the revolutionary part of the Azerbaijani public. A criminal case was filed against Oxfam’s Azerbaijani office. Haqqin.az pointed out that Oxfam regional director for former Soviet countries was **Olga Ghazaryan**. “In order to carry out some obviously conspiratorial activities in Azerbaijan, Ms Ghazaryan has managed to create an effective and well-branched

²³ “Азербайджан депортировал 8-летнего ребенка из-за армянского происхождения”, Iarex.ru, 31 May 2016, accessed February 14, 2018: <http://www.iarex.ru/news/52665.html>

²⁴ Leyla Yunus was arrested in Baku on 30 July 2014. She was charged with high treason, tax evasion, illegal entrepreneurship, forgery and large-scale fraud. Her husband Arif Yunus, again a human rights defender, also faced charges of high treason and large-scale fraud. In August 2015, Baku Court of Grave Crimes brought in a verdict against Leyla and Arif Yunus, sentencing them to 8.5 years and 7 years’ imprisonment respectively. On 9 December, Baku Court of Appeal released Leyla Yunus from the courtroom imposing suspended sentence. On 12 November, the same court made a decision to release Arif Yunus. His detention was altered with a signed undertaking for not leaving the country. In April 2016, the authorities permitted them to leave the country for treatment.

“Лейла Юнус: «Моя дочь боялась признаться, что ее бабушка армянка»”, 1news.az, 5 May 2014, accessed February 14, 2018: <http://www.1news.az/news/leyla-yunus-moya-doch-boyalas-priznat-sya-chto-ee-babushka-armyanka>

²⁵ [Video] LEYLA YUNUSA QARŞI POLİSİN TƏZYİQİ, YouTube.com, 28 April 2014, accessed February 14, 2018: <https://youtu.be/xHEPYyB96Ks>

²⁶ “В Азербайджане народ и власть едины – Сиявуш Новрузов”, Salamnews.org, 14 September 2015, accessed February 14, 2018: <http://www.salamnews.org/ru/news/read/188217>

network in the whole country,” the website writes.²⁷

Some Azerbaijani media outlets launched a negative PR campaign against **People in Need** (PIN), a Czech NGO, labelling it as pro-Armenian. The concerted media effort started after PIN presented an exhibition on political prisoners in Azerbaijan during Eastern Partnership Civil Society Forum in Batumi in late November. “This is yet another example of what other international organizations working on Azerbaijan have faced,” says PIN director Šimon Pánek. Independent and respected international organisations such as Human Rights Watch and Amnesty International have regularly been accused of prejudice, bias and “pro-Armenian position.”²⁸

T-shirts with **Kim Kardashian** text print appeared on stalls in Baku. The T-shirts of the actress and photo model of Armenian descent are sold in Sadarak and Bina clothes markets. The Azerbaijani website Haqqin.az puts a question to those wearing these T-shirts whether they know that Kardashian is Armenian.²⁹

Azerbaijani media sounded an alarm: the trailer of *The Cut*, an Armenian-Genocide-related film by **Fatih Akin**, a German director of Turkish origin, was broadcast in Baku cinemas. This was in line with a contract with the distributor Universal Pictures, which allowed for an advertising campaign and trailers before the start of the films. However, **Yusif Sheikhov**, the Head of Cinematography sector of the Film Propaganda and Registration Department at the Ministry of Culture and Tourism of Azerbaijan, stated the demonstration of the trailer of *The Cut* in Azerbaijan was unacceptable. “This situation in the cinemas is merely outrageous.”³⁰

The Azerbaijani website **Faktxeber.com** published extracts from “Mother saw me with her eyes in tears,” a book by Famil Huseynov. The book spreads Armenophobia using stories, which demonise the Armenians in the eyes of the Azerbaijani public. Before death, the old man revealed him an awful secret: he was an Armenian diversionist from Dashnak Party, who had been prepared in a secret school called *The Kind Future of the Armenian People*, located in the town of Spitak, since his childhood until the 5th grade. After that, he was transferred to the 1st grade in the neighbouring “Turkish” school. According to the story, the hero was taken to his father’s destroyed house when he was 14 so that he could see his parents’ and sister’s corpses as an evidence of the Turks’ atrocities and develop “the patriotic spirit.” Further, the hero “confesses” his diversionary activities. As a student in Baku, he snitched on his teachers -- who were representatives of the country’s intellectual layer -- to People’s Commissariat for Internal Affairs as a result of which they disappeared. “The Armenian Dashnak’s” activities do not cease here, however.

²⁷ “Новая Мишень Генпрокуратуры: «Дело Газарян - Оxfam - Ибадоглу» В Азербайджане (Наше Расследование)”, Haqqin.az, 27 May 2014, accessed February 14, 2018: <http://haqqin.az/multimedia/23018>.

²⁸ “People in NEED: За обвинениями в проармянской позиции стоят власти Азербайджана”, Minval.az, accessed February 14, 2018: <https://minval.az/news/69562>

²⁹ “Ким Кардашьян Приедет На Открытие Бутиков В Садарак? (Наш Комментарий)”, Haqqin.az, 4 June 2014, accessed February 14, 2018: <http://haqqin.az/news/23563>

³⁰ “Министерство Культуры И Туризма Азербайджана Прокомментировало Инцидент С Показом В Кинотеатрах Трейлера Фильма О Т.Н. «Геноциде» Армян”, 10 February 2015, accessed February 14, 2018: <http://www.1news.az/bomond/bomaz/20150210035109888.html>

When the Great Patriotic War broke out, he received a task on the frontline to kill Azi Aslanov, a Soviet Union hero. The task, however, was completed by his “schoolmates.” According to the author, the moral of the story is that the Azerbaijanis are trustful people and that the disguised “diversionist Armenians” are still plotting in Azerbaijan carrying out “dirty operations.”³¹

In an article published on **Gundelik Baku** newspaper’s website, journalist **Gunel Mehdi** writes that **Aynishan Guliyeva**, the daughter of the Honoured Artist of Azerbaijan **Aybeniz Hashimova**, has become a target of the Azerbaijanis’ severe criticism for taking a photo with an Armenian. The author also mentions the case with Sabina Rahimova – the Azerbaijani representative at New Star 10 song contest – who posted her selfie with the Georgian and Armenian (Levon Harutyunyan) representatives online, naming it “All the Caucasians Together.” Mehdi believes that “an Armenian cannot be good” and she urges her compatriots “to avoid the Armenians, never shoot a film with them, not to go to concerts, banquets and events, not to sit next to them or take a photo with the representatives of that nation.”³²

Behbudov Bakir Amirjan Oglu, an Azerbaijani militant who had taken part in punitive operations against Armenian villages near Aghdam district during the Soviet rule in 1988-1989, told a local website how his detachment was ordered to take an Armenian into captivity and how they came across a man of about 50 years cutting wood in the forest. The man showed resistance and the Azerbaijanis had to kill him unable to take him captive. One of the Azerbaijanis, named Nadir, cut off the Armenian’s head and put it into a sack, which they later took with them and put in the boot of their car. Behbudov boasts that the Armenian’s head remained in the boot for several days. “One day, we were having dinner in a café. Three investigators from Baku were having dinner at the neighbouring table. They started mocking at us saying that we had rather kill Armenians instead of growing beard. Gamlo, one of my friends, got angry and brought the Armenian’s head from the car putting it on the table. They went silent and made friends with us. I still have the knife I used to slaughter the Armenian,” the Azerbaijani militant said.³³

Gundelik Baku-based Newspaper:

“A separate department should be created within the Ministry of National Security to investigate the Armenian blood among the population. For example, the parents who intend to marry their children could apply to that department to check if their future relatives have blood relation to the Armenians. And maybe by then we can clear

31 “Ermenistanda Yetişdirilən “Azərbaycan Türkləri””, Faktxeber.com - Azərbaycan Onlayn Xəbər Portalı, 26 August 2014, accessed February 14, 2018: http://www.faktxeber.com/ermnistanda-yetidiriln-azrbaycan-trklri_h449116.html

32 The original source in <http://gundelik-baku.com/index.php?newsid=15437#.VRzqPLJasu> is not accessible any more. Cited in: “Азербайджанскую певицу подвергли обструкции на родине из-за «селфи» с грузинкой и армянином”, Panorama.am, 3 April 2015, accessed February 14, 2018: <https://www.panorama.am/ru/news/2015/04/03/azerbaijan-singer/79998>

33 “Onun Başını Kəsdiyimiz Bıçaq İndi Də Məndədir...” - CƏBHƏ XƏTİTİ”, Publika.az, 16 July 2015, accessed February 14, 2018: <http://publika.az/news/other/100984.html>

| *our blood from mixing with dirty Armenian blood.”³⁴*

Haqqin.az:

| *“I could never understand Namik Abbasov due to his fondness of the Armenians. Everyone he made friends with were somehow in a family relation with Armenians.”³⁵*

Kultura.az: on December 18, 2012 Azerbaijani news portal “Kultura.az” published an excerpt from a book, “Caucasian days,” based on the autobiography of the author – Banine, a French-Azerbaijani writer. The article is titled as follows: “Our favorite game in childhood was “**massacre of Armenians**” and dismemberment of our friend Tamar”.³⁶ The published parts tell about racist, insulting and degrading attitude and treatment towards an Armenian child, Tamar, by Azerbaijani peers. The author herself describes the attitude as “racist.”³⁷ Evidently, the purpose of the article is to spread further hatred and animosity against Armenians, and, on the other hand, indicates the deeply rooted hatred towards Armenians in general.

Modern.az:

| *“The Armenian women are a delay-action bomb with an inevitably mortal outcome. The Armenians” imperial strategists have elaborated a plan of eliminating the Turkic people as single unities through genetics and mixing blood, which they have put into implementation.”³⁸*

RFE/RL: A significant part of president candidates’ TV-debates in Azerbaijan has turned into a quarrel seasoned with mutual insults. During one of these debates, **Hafiz Hajiyev**, chairman of pro-government **Muasir Musavat Party**, accused historian **Jamil Hasanli**, the sole opposition candidate, of having family ties with Armenians.”

“Jamil Hasanli, everyone calls you aqsaqal. Still, how come can an aqsaqal have Armenian son-in-law? You are attempting to destroy our country. Websites belonging to your patrons, that is, Armenians, have initiated an attack against me,” Hafiz Hajiyev said. The opposition candidate’s immediate yet extremely spectacular response followed this accusation. “I would like to remind Hafiz Hajiyev a detail. Weren’t that you saying in 1996 that Heydar Aliyev’s mother is of Armenian descent? You were even arrested for these statements back then. And now the authorities are trying to use this person against me,”

34 The original source in <http://gundelik-baku.com/index.php?newsid=11357#.UTd14KwZkWE> is not accessible any more. Cited in: “В Азербайджане резко возросла женская пассионарность и стремление принять участие в «борьбе с армянами»”, Panorama.am, 27 March 2014, accessed February 14, 2018: <https://www.panorama.am/ru/news/2014/03/27/adibekyan-elibegova/323140>

35 “Намик Аббасов написал Иноятову, что Я гаварь преступной группировки”, Haqqin.az, 18 December 2013, accessed February 14, 2018: <http://haqqin.az/news/14429>

36 “Азербайджанская Писательница: Нашей Любимой Игрой В Детстве Была «Резня Армян» И Расчленение Нашей Подруги Тамар”, Panorama.am, 27 December 2012, accessed February 14, 2018, http://panorama.am/ru/society/2012/12/27/assadullayev/#.UNv9I_xSHzo. The original source: “Banine - Qafqaz günləri (tərcümədə ixtisara salınmış hissə)”, Kultura.az, 18 December 2012, accessed February 14, 2018, <http://www.kultura.az/news/20121217092551908>

37 Ibid.

38 Erməni Qadınları Və Azərbaycanlıların Erməniləşdirilməsi Prosesi...”, Modern.az, 5 August 2013, accessed February 14, 2018: <http://modern.az/articles/42613/1/>

Hasanli said.³⁹

Turan:

“A professor at a university in Azerbaijan described his students quite enthusiastically and in vivid colours how he would suffocate barehanded even a little Armenian child without any pity.” The professor ran theory of radio-journalism and worked at AZTV radio at the same time. “That professor had just one “cast-iron argument” against any critical statement: “How can you criticise our president when our country faces a problem like the Armenians? This is what you need to focus on”⁴⁰

Vesti.az:

“We do not say that Mkhitaryan and Movsisyan⁴¹ are talentless players. Just the contrary, no one can question their talent even though they have one shortcoming – they were unfortunate enough to be born Armenians.”⁴²

³⁹ The source in <https://www.radiozadlyg.org/a/25130082.html> is not accessible any more due to shutdown of RFE/RL branch in Azerbaijan. Cited in: “«Армянский фактор» на азербайджанских выборах”, Azatutyun.am (RFE/RL branch in Armenia), 7 October 2013, accessed February 14, 2018: <https://rus.azatutyun.am/a/25129474.html>

⁴⁰ The source in <http://contact.az/docs/2013/Want%20to%20Say/020400026970ru.htm> is not accessible any more. Cited in: “«Туран»: В Азербайджане преподаватель вуза рассказывал студентам, как задушил бы даже маленького армянского ребенка”, Panorama.am, 4 February 2013, accessed February 14, 2018: <https://www.panorama.am/ru/news/2013/02/04/az-lecturer/592569>

⁴¹ Henrikh Mkhitaryan and Yura Movsisyan are well-known Armenian football players.

⁴² “Арбитр Матча Азербайджан – Россия Получил В Дорогу Несколько Банок Черной Икры...”, Vesti.az, 16 October 2013, accessed February 14, 2018: <http://vesti.az/news/177408>

2.4 Educational Literature

Anti-Armenian xenophobia is also deeply embedded in Azerbaijani educational materials and literature, ensuring that anti-Armenian sentiments are injected and nurtured with the population from early childhood. This has been well-documented and corroborated by a number of sources, excerpts from some of such sources are summarized below:

Amiram Grigorov, poet:

“The ideological base of today’s authorities in Azerbaijan is the thoroughly cultivated absolute hatred towards the neighbouring Armenians [...] For instance, it is a common practice in the Azerbaijani historiography to claim that the Armenians’ arrival to the Caucasus is connected with the Russians who settled ‘the ancient Azerbaijani lands’ with newcomers from the territory of modern Turkey. Undoubtedly, any historical criticism will destroy this ideology and yet it is widely used. In the Azerbaijani schools, for example, mythological information about Turkic Azerbaijan’s multi-thousand-year-long history in the Caucasus is taught during the classes of history. Naive materials and conglomerations of made-up theories – what is recognised as “folk history” – are implemented. Ill-conditioned fascist films are produced [...] The pogroms of the Armenians in Sumgait, however, are not normally remembered in Azerbaijan. They are either kept silent upon or a horrifying lie is made up about the Armenians being slaughtered by the Armenians in Sumgait. The most interesting part is that they are able to believe in that lie. They are more comfortable with that. It is not accepted to remember about Baku pogroms.”¹

Leyla Yunus, a renowned Azerbaijani human rights defender, Director of

¹ “Национальное государство как “фабрика вечной ненависти”. К травле писателя Айлисли”, Однако, 11 February 2013, accessed February 15, 2018: <http://www.odnako.org/blogs/nacionalnoe-gosudarstvo-kak-fabrika-vechnoy-nenavisti-k-travle-pisatelya-aylisli/>

the Institute of Peace and Democracy

“Since they are 10 years old, the children are made to believe that the Azerbaijanis’ enemies are the Christians and the Armenians are called ‘faithless people in black garments.’ A PhD-holder in History, I could never conceive that the school textbooks of history could hold that those guilty of the division of Azerbaijan’s Muslims into Shias and Sunnis were the Christians and of course Armenians. [...] And now, when all the pro-government newspapers, online outlets, radio- and TV-channels are every day calling me and my husband ‘traitors’ of the motherland and ‘enemies’ and screaming that I am not ‘a pure Azerbaijani’ but a Russian-speaking ‘half-blood,’ when Police Colonel I. Asadov publicly justifies the police officers’ violence against me in front of journalists by saying that I am not Azerbaijani but Armenian, I get scared for my country’s future.”²

Sabir Akhundov, historian:

“In the official narrative, the scale of century-old hostility and Azerbaijan’s human loss has been gradually inflated until it reached the level of genocide — which is precisely the case with the Azerbaijani-Armenian clashes of the early 20th century. [...] History books usually refer to these events as the ‘March clashes,’ but in Azerbaijan they are known as the ‘March genocide.’ [...] These events were thus to serve as a demonstration of the bloodthirstiness and unscrupulousness of Armenians. [...] Photos of Azerbaijani victims were also published — these images loom large in the secondary school history curriculum.”³

“In 2007, a mass burial was discovered in the town of Guba, and although initially Makhmud Kerimov, president of Azerbaijan’s Academy of Sciences, warned against jumping to conclusions, suggesting that it could have been the result of an epidemic, the government propaganda machine rushed to exploit the news. [...] The general conclusion has been that this was part of the genocide carried out by Armenians in 1918. [...] The Guba events are included in the history textbook used for the fifth year of Azerbaijan’s schools. In one chapter, its authors write about an elderly woman visiting the burial site with her granddaughter and finding the skeleton of her sister, which she recognised by a medallion that had belonged to her. From the reaction of some pupils, one can say that the story’s main aim — to act on the children’s still unformed consciousness — was successful. The youngsters recalled that reading the story brought tears to their eyes. The same idea lies behind a school ritual followed every 31 March, Genocide Day. As on other dates connected with tragic events, 20 January [the ‘Black January’ of 1990] and 26 February [the

day of the Khojali incident], this usually takes a theatrical form, with pupils dressed in mourning reading poetry, as well as competitions for drawings on the theme of war. This is how the image of victimhood is consolidated in the child’s mind, as is the parallel image of the Enemy, who will with each year loom ever larger and more terrifying. The pupils must understand that Armenia’s hostility has lasted for centuries, is still strong and will continue in the future. This growing generation will never even consider any possibility of peaceful coexistence. The chapter on ‘The Division of Azerbaijan’ in the fifth year Azerbaijan History textbook states: ‘On 21 March 1828, the day of Novruz [New Year], a fictitious ‘Armenian province’ was set up in the area of Nakhchivan and Yerevan, thus rewarding the Armenians for their treachery against our people.’ And in the same textbook, in the chapter on the March 1918 massacres, we read that: ‘the Armenians went berserk and burned men, women and old people. Children were impaled on bayonets. These maddened Armenian executioners then collected copies of our sacred book, the Quran, made bonfires of them and threw Muslims, bound hand and foot, into them.’ And as for the chapter on Stalin’s Terror of 1937, schoolchildren discover that most victims were persecuted thanks to the Armenians, in a continuation of their dastardly genocide policy. We can summarise the rest of the narrative in one passage from the eleventh year textbook: ‘A prominent role in the organisation of the Terror was played by [...] Armenians, genetic enemies of the Turkic peoples, who held senior posts in the police and security services.’⁴

Tofig Veliyev, head of the Slavic history department at Baku State University, is the author of History textbook for 11th grade, and insists he had to use negative language in order to tell the truth. “Those phrases give an accurate picture of the Armenians,” Veliyev said.⁵

Arif Yunusov:

“The image of the ‘enemy’ is formed starting from the textbook for the fifth grade, that is, since the very first year of teaching the subject of history. It is true that technically it is still not a textbook on the history of Azerbaijan; it is called Fatherland (‘Ana yurdu’), but written in a very emotional way, especially pronounced in the description of Azerbaijan’s confrontation with ‘others,’ much more so when dealing with the subject of its ‘historical’ enemies. Incidentally, one of the central if not the principal points covered in the textbook refers to sacrificing oneself in the name and for the benefit of the motherland. Thus, in the section entitled ‘Those Who Live for the Motherland Elevate it,’ only a small portion is dedicated to the figures of culture and art. The narrative mostly covers heroes (Babek, Kerogly and Shah Ismail) who dedicate their lives to the motherland fighting in the name

² “Лейла Юнусова: «Я не боюсь смерти, Я не боюсь тюрьмы. Я горда тем, что стала опасной для режима, оккупировавшего мою родину - Азербайджан...»”, Iarex.ru, 18 May 2014, accessed February 15, 2018, <http://www.iarex.ru/interviews/47923.html>

³ “Azerbaijanism”, Open democracy, 3 August 2016, accessed February 15, 2018: <https://www.opendemocracy.net/od-russia/sabir-akhundov/azerbaijanism>

⁴ Ibid.

⁵ “History Lessons In Armenia And Azerbaijan”, Institute For War And Peace Reporting, 2 March 2012, accessed February 15, 2018: <https://iwpr.net/global-voices/history-lessons-armenia-and-azerbaijan>

| *of its independence.*⁶

According to Yunusov, the patriotic education holds a significant place in the Azerbaijani textbooks and directly ensues from the doctrine of “fighting the enemies,” represented by the Armenians, as well as the willingness to sacrifice own lives for the motherland and in the “heroic struggle” against the enemies. In subsequent sections of the textbook, its authors pay increasing attention to Armenians who begin to be perceived as “the main infidels clad in black.” Also, a variety of negative epithets (“bandits,” “aggressors,” “perfidious,” “hypocritical” etc.) are used in respect of the Armenians. It were the “perfidious” Armenians who helped Russia in conquering Azerbaijan, it was the result of the “insurrection of Armenian bandits” in Karabakh in 1920 that the main forces of the Azerbaijani army were pulled back from the northern borders, a chance that was exploited by the 11th Red Army which invaded Azerbaijan. Thus, the “black-clad infidels once again committed their black deed.” In the final part of the textbook, its authors decisively shape the image of the enemy represented by Armenians who have waged for centuries a struggle against the Azerbaijani people and continue to do so in our days:

| *“Armenians, the black-clad infidels and their patrons resort to every treachery and conspire schemes to weaken and isolate our state.”*

In what follows, the Turkic origin of some persons is constantly underscored. The authors get so carried away with their love for Turkisation that they contrive to make preposterous and absurd statements:

| *“In 337, the Albanian ruler Sanatruk (Sanaturk of Turkic origin, according to the version advanced by the authors of the textbook) led a campaign against Armenia and “protected the local Turkic population from the encroachments of the Christian preachers!” In the following year, the Armenian military leader, Vache Mamikonyan, launched a retaliation campaign against Albania and defeated Sanatruk’s army. However, the pupils who read about this event will find out that the Armenian military leader Mamikonyan was actually of [...] Turkic rather than Armenian origin. And, in general, Turkic people played a prominent role in spreading and strengthening Christianity in Armenia! This means we have an absurd picture: First, Turkic people spread Christianity in Armenia. In response to that, another Turk from the territory of Albania leads an incursion into Armenia in order to protect the local Turkic people from Christians. This is followed by a retaliation campaign by another Turk, but a Christian this time, who defeated the army of a non-Christian Turk!”*

Fatherland, textbook for the 5th grade:

| *“[...] It was 1945. In January, fierce fighting raged on the Baltic shore near the city of Mitawa. As before, the brigade of the General H.*

| *Aslanov was in the vanguard. The victory over the enemy was drawing near with every new day, and it seemed that the tanks of the courageous general will be the first to enter Berlin - the den of fascism. This was the situation on January 24, 1945 as the heroic son of our people who had gone through the horrors of Stalingrad, through the hell of the Battle of Kursk, General Hazi Aslanov died under obscure circumstances. Who knows, maybe in revealing the circumstances of this death, another case of base Armenian perfidy and treachery will be unearthed?”*⁷

Tahir Ibrahimov, a teacher of history with a service record of 25 years, considers that textbooks reflect the truth about Armenians. In his opinion, with a war going on between the two peoples, it is impossible to create a positive image of the enemy:

| *“Children must have real information about their history. Facts about Armenians may not be distorted. Besides, by the age the children are given these classes, they already possess information about the real deeds of Armenians. In our textbooks, we cannot write the opposite.”*

Ibrahimov also believes that textbooks do not contain any denigration of Armenians, but report true facts:

| *“If these facts make Armenians uneasy, let them change their nature. We may not raise our children in lies just to please them. Presently, there are thousands of pupils whose parents are refugees from Karabakh. They know what Armenians did long before their history classes. Why should we deceive them?”*

The dualist approach taken by the psychologist **Elmira Qasimzadeh** is noteworthy:

| *“A textbook should not be turned into an instrument of vengeance... instead, attention must be paid to forming historical thinking in pupils. The textbooks must contain essential points enabling to assess one’s country and motherland correctly. I wouldn’t like our patriotism to be measured in the extent of our hatred.”*

On the other hand, she says the following:

| *“In our textbooks, I never saw any appeals to kill Armenians or the ideas that Armenians are our enemies. My child goes to school. Indeed, children are well-informed of the wrongdoings perpetrated by Armenians from television and books. How can we conceal from children the tragedies of January 20, Khojaly and the occupation of our lands? Or, children must learn the whole truth about the history through a factual language: you can’t teach children a false history.”*

Foreword to the storybook **Hale** for high school students:

6 “Мифы И Образы «Врага» В Исторической Науке И Учебниках По Истории Независимого Азербайджана (I) - Кавказ: Новости, История, Традиции”, Kavkazoved.info, 11 October 2011, accessed February 15, 2018: <http://www.kavkazoved.info/news/2011/10/11/mify-i-obrazy-vraga-v-istoricheskoy-nauke-azerbajdzhana-i.html>

7 “Обыкновенный Идиотизм Азербайджанских Учебников”, Newsland, 26 August 2009, accessed February 15, 2018: <http://newsland.com/news/detail/id/403193/>

“My young friend!

Hey, the Azerbaijani offspring of an ancient and powerful Turkic nation!

A piece of your treasure named Azerbaijan, starting from the mahal of Aghbaba to the region of Aghdam moans under the heel of a nation that has declared you an eternal historical enemy, a nation that has no future, whose morality is dead, who has all kinds of mixed waste running through its veins, a spiteful and scorned nation. You have confronted face to face such a loathsome foe who shuns no savagery, baseness, abomination, barbarity, hypocrisy, slander and evil, who lives and nurtures hopes of creating on a territory where he does not have a single inch of historical lands a state named Great Armenia extending from the Black to the Caspian Sea.

On his way, the foe spilled the Turkic blood, but was never sated. At times, he feigned friendship and gaining our trust revealed his relentless enmity. Laughing us in the face, he prepared a pitfall for us by choosing the way of treachery and treason. Always abusing our kind-heartedness, friendship, fidelity to neighbours and generosity, in a word, our love of fellow men, the enemy turned it into a weapon against us, repaid good with evil by laying bare his treacherous nature. At the earliest opportunity, they drew their daggers to stab in the back those who had given them refuge, food, drink, protection extending them a helping hand. Armenians turned us into innocent victims of the policy of ethnic cleansings. We fell victims to genocide.

This restless nation with the satanic blood running through their veins has committed against us countless acts of terror.

They wagged their tails before the Russian Empire which had always kept us under occupation, and they relied on its power and protection. As a rule, they would succeed in isolating and excluding us. For 200 years, the Russian Empire kept our hands tied and urged the Armenians to strike at us.

Armenians took full advantage of this and turned the treachery into a national trait by overstepping the boundaries of unbridled insolence.

At every step, they showed aggression against us and seized parts of our sacred land. And they chose the city of Irevan as their capital which was previously our motherland.”⁸

⁸ Alisahib Erogul, Hale, collection of short stories. Supplementary reading for middle school students. Baku, Teknur, 2011. [Online resource] <http://azerichild.info/HALE.pdf>

Azerbaijani History textbook for **9th graders:**⁹

The textbook shows an interstate struggle for owning the Azerbaijani lands and the results of this struggle, Russia and Iran’s insidious policy, as well as the Armenians’ despicable role in the implementation of that policy. A sufficient amount of historical facts unveiling that policy is presented and analysed in detail. (page 5)

Historian **Mirza Adigezal** bek writes that the Russian troops invaded the lands of Gyandzha and captured its neighbouring areas. Gathering his people and troops, Javad Khan went to meet them. An armed clash took place between the two troops in an area called Guru Gobu 2 versts [about 2 km] from Gyandzha and a fight started. Local Armenians known for their indigenously treacherous nature helped the Russian troops with all their might to capture the khanate. (Page 180)

The town was captured by the Russian troops following the bloody battles. Javad Khan and his son Huseyngulu Agha heroically fell in the unequal battle. The Armenians demonstrated their meanness till the end. (page 182)

Azerbaijan History textbook doe **10th grade:**¹⁰

“The sly and corrupt Armenians lied to them signing a treaty in one place and making a massacre in the other. Our eternal enemies, the Armenian nationalists, fortified their positions with Armenian volunteers invited from Iran and Ottoman Empire. Despite this, the Armenian side had bigger losses. The main reason was the courage and heroism of the Azerbaijani youth. The legendary Gachags especially stood out in the battles against the Armenians.”

“In early February 1905, before the national massacre in Baku, the Armenians diligently spread opinion about the Muslims’ bloodthirstiness and savagery. They implemented all the methods and dirty schemes to expulse the Azerbaijanis from their homes.”

“Disappointed with the results of the massacre in Baku and Nakhchivan, the Armenians decided to take revenge against the Muslims settled in the town of Irevan and its neighbouring areas.” (pages 178-179)

“The Armenians, however, did not make proper conclusions from what happened. They bribed General Galashapov with 10 thousand manats in June 1906. A squad consisting of Cossacks, Russian soldiers and 10 thousand bandits was created to carry out abominable crimes in Shusha and in the villages nearby.” (page 182)

“After the World War I, those intending to spread their influence on the

⁹ Mammadov S., Veliyev T., Gojayev A.M. ‘Azerbaijan History (9th grade textbook). Second Edition. Baku, Takhsil, 2002.

¹⁰ Veliyev T., Aliyev R., Tagiyeva Sh., Gojayev A., Alishova Kh., Mammadova K. Azerbaijan History. Textbook for 10th grade. Baku, Chashioglu, 2009.

eastern countries used the Armenians, Assyrians and Kurds for their aims making them weapons in their hands. After the Russian troops left Southern Azerbaijan, the English troops seized Zanjan, Miyan, Khoy and Urmia before spring 1918. At the same time, these states incited the Assyrians, Kurds and Armenians to literally perpetrate genocide against Azerbaijanis in the north-west of Southern Azerbaijan.” (page 212)

“During a speech, A.M. Topchibashev said the Armenians were in a secret collusion with the Russians to prepare a new mass murder of Muslims in Baku, Irevan, Kars and in other regions in the South Caucasus. This thought brought about a strong uneasiness among the delegates of the congress. A delegation headed by A.M. Topchibashev was sent to St. Petersburg on May 9 to inform the Temporal Government about this.” (page 216)

“In essence, the escalation of the Armenians” historical animosity against the Azerbaijanis served an impulse for the development of the national liberation movement in Azerbaijan in order to carry out the irreconcilable struggle against the Armenians who came up in the same block with the Russians. The united efforts of all the layers of the Azerbaijani people were needed.” (page 218)

Azerbaijani History textbook for **11th graders**:¹¹

“Sumbatov-Topuridze, Grigoryan, Malyan and other Armenians holding senior positions in the Internal Affairs structures played a crucial role in organising the mass repressions, being genetic enemies of the Turkic people. In the years when the repressions reached their culmination, Armenians were heading the regional departments of the People’s Commissariat for Internal Affairs in 31 of 51 districts of Azerbaijan.” (page 87)

“A railway was constructed from Aghdam to Khankendi in 1979. A new region called Askeran was established in the area. The Armenians, however, did not give up their evil intentions. The attempt to raise the Nagorno Karabakh issue again was resolutely suppressed in 1977. In the 1970s, the Armenians incited the centre to raise the issue of resettling the local residents and dividing the territory of the region between the republics as highland pasture on the pretext that Kalbajar district lacked prospects of development. Heydar Aliyev enlivened the economy of the area in a short period thus blocking the Armenian nationalists” attempts. The Mughan road was constructed to Kalbajar.” (page 140)

Aphorisms and Maxims:

Hatred against Armenians is even represented in aphorisms and maxims created for the purpose of establishing and rooting hatred against Armenia and Armenians. Below are some examples of those aphorisms:

“Armenians do not have brains, they have violence instead,” “Perfidy is the national Industry of Armenia,” “many Armenians are even ready to commit suicide, in order to make the world believe in Genocide,” “Having declared violence as its method once, Armenia should have inevitably chosen lying as her principle,” “The most dangerous Armenians are those, who pray to god.”¹²

11 Azerbaijan History. Textbook for 11th grade. Baku, Chashioglu, 2009.

12 See: <http://azerichild.info/en/proverbs-azerbaijan-childhood-6.html>

3.3. Armenophobia as a Violation of International Law

The section below assesses the documented instances of Armenophobia by the Azerbaijani authorities and the Azerbaijani society addressed above in light of the existing public international law rules and principles, as well as the practice of international courts and tribunals.

3.1 Armenophobia by the Azerbaijani Government

Under contemporary international law speech inciting hatred towards specific ethnic groups, especially when uttered by individuals holding office, is prohibited by a number of international instruments.

Thus, according to Article 7 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights “[a]ll are entitled to equal protection against any discrimination [...] and against any incitement to such discrimination”.¹ The most comprehensive treaty prohibition is, of course, enshrined under the Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Racial Discrimination (“CERD”).² Article 2, paragraph 1, of the CERD provides as follows:

States Parties condemn racial discrimination and undertake to pursue by all appropriate means and without delay a policy of eliminating racial discrimination in all its forms and promoting understanding among all races, and, to this end:

(a) Each State Party undertakes to engage in no act or practice of racial discrimination against persons, groups of persons or institutions and to ensure that all public authorities and public institutions, national and local, shall act in conformity with this obligation;

(b) [...];

(c) Each State Party shall take effective measures to review governmental, national and local policies, and to amend, rescind or nullify any laws and regulations which have the effect of creating or perpetuating racial discrimination wherever it exists [...].

Article 20, paragraph 2 of the International Covenant on Civil and Po-

¹ GA Resolution 217 (III) (A), UN Doc. A/RES/217(III)(A) (10 December 1948).

² Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, March 7, 1966, 660 UNTS 195.

litical Rights (“ICCPR”) states that “any advocacy of national, racial or religious hatred that constitutes incitement to discrimination, hostility or violence shall be prohibited by law”.³ And of course the ICCPR addresses the issue of incitement to discrimination in a number of its provisions (preamble and Article 4).

Though no similar provision on prohibition of advocacy of racial and other forms of hatred is enshrined in the European Convention on Human Rights, however the extensive jurisprudence of the European Court of Human Rights (“ECHR”) has developed specific standards in order to assess the permissible standards for the manifestation of freedom of speech. Thus, according to the ECHR “Article 10 [of the European Convention on Human Rights] should not be interpreted in such a way as to limit, derogate from or destroy the right to protection against racial discrimination under the UN Convention”.⁴

The prohibition is not only codified under international treaties and resolutions of international organizations, but is also reflective of crystalized customary international law. Thus, in Prosecutor v. Nahimana et al. judgment the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda indicated as follows:

The Chamber considers, in light of well-established principles of international and domestic law, and the jurisprudence of the Streicher case in 1946 and the many European Court and domestic cases since then, that hate speech that expresses ethnic and other forms of discrimination violates the norm of customary international law prohibiting discrimination.⁵

Despite this fact, as it has been showcased in the previous chapters, statements of the Azerbaijani authorities have been consistently ripe with anti-Armenian hatred and propaganda, starting from the highest levels of the governmental hierarchy. **The President of Azerbaijan** himself in his speeches and statements has been continuously inciting hatred and animosity towards Armenia and Armenians. References to “*Armenian barbarians*,” “*Armenian vandals*” and “*Armenian fascists*” are a consistent feature of a significant part of the public statements of the President of Azerbaijan irrespective of the nature of the event.

Especially alarming are cases of praising individuals for killing Armenians whether that is done on the battlefield or in peacetime.

The developments surrounding the **Ramil Safarov** incident is probably the utmost alarming case of hate speech. After his extradition from Hungary Safarov was welcomed as a hero in Azerbaijan – this is a matter of public knowledge covered by the international media, including by sources such as the BBC ⁶, Al Jazeera ⁷, Radio Free Europe ⁸ and others.

³ International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, art. 20(2), December 16, 1966, 999 UNTS 171.

⁴ See e.g. Jersild v. Denmark, Application no. 15890, GC Judgment of 23 September 1994, ¶27.

⁵ Prosecutor v. Nahimana et al., Case no. ICTR-99-52-T, Judgment and Sentence (3 December 2003), ¶1076.

⁶ “Azeri killer Ramil Safarov: Concern over Armenian anger”, BBC News, 3 September 2012, accessed March 12, 2018: <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-19463968>

⁷ “Hero’s welcome for Azerbaijan axe murder”, Al Jazeera, 2 September 2012, accessed March 12, 2018: <http://www.aljazeera.com/video/europe/2012/09/201291215548920251.html>

⁸ “As Armenia protests killer’s pardon, Azerbaijan promotes him”, Radio Free Europe, 2 September 2012, accessed March 12, 2018: <http://www.rferl.org/content/armenia-protest-azerbaijani-killer-pardon-to-osce-minsk-group/24694817.html>

All these sources highlight that Safarov “*was given a hero’s welcome*,” “*re-instated [...] to the army*,” “*promoted [...] from the military rank of lieutenant to major*,” as well as was awarded “*over eight years in back pay*” and “*a free apartment*” by the Azerbaijani Defense Minister **Safar Abiyev**, who also “*went on to wish Safarov future success in his military career*.” This information is further confirmed by Azerbaijani sources.⁹

However, more importantly, the aforementioned information is corroborated by the European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (hereinafter “the ECRI”) in its Report on Azerbaijan (5th monitoring cycle).¹⁰

As a matter of fact, glorification of Safarov’s acts was the rule and not the exception within the Azerbaijani society. Statements from high-ranking government officials, party members and representatives of the civil society alike – both before Safarov’s release and after that – show that there was a systematic and directed attempt at turning Safarov into a national hero.

Apart from the general thread of glorification granted to Ramil Safarov, one aspect of his welcome in Azerbaijan deserves special attention – that is the army promotion, payment of salary and the granting of an apartment by the Ministry of Defense. This matter needs to be assessed under the lens of Azerbaijani legislation.

In particular, the benefits granted to Mr. Safarov are those that under the Code of the Criminal Procedure of Azerbaijan are granted to acquitted and wrongfully prosecuted or arrested individuals. Namely, loss of salary (Article 58(3)(1)), reinstating at a previous position (Article 59(1)(1)), inclusion of deprivation of liberty into the period of professional employment (Article 59(1)(2)), provision of accommodation (Article 59(1)(3)), restoration of military ranks (Article 59(1)(4)) are compensations extended under the Code of Criminal Procedure of Azerbaijan to individuals who are acquitted, with respect to whom the prosecution is discontinued, who are unlawfully arrested etc. (Article 56).

Notably, these benefits were granted to Ramil Safarov despite the fact that no indication as to removal of conviction was made in the act of pardon itself – it only mentioned the release of Safarov from his sentence.

This act suggests that the Republic of Azerbaijan does not simply view Mr. Safarov as someone that has had a just and reasoned conviction. Furthermore, the period under the sentence is viewed by the Republic of Azerbaijan as a period under military service for which the salary in back pays was granted. The grant of the apartment further exacerbates this situation.

Radical discriminatory statements made by high-level public authorities and directed against Armenia have become the inherent element of the everyday public life in Azerbaijan. Such statements are made irrespective of the nature of the event or the environment in which they are made, be that the opening of a new factory, construction of new buildings, erection of a new

⁹ “Azerbaijani Defense Ministry grants apartment to Ramil Safarov”, Trend News Agency, 1 September 2012, accessed March 12, 2018: <http://en.trend.az/azerbaijan/society/2060913.html>

¹⁰ European Commission against Racism and Intolerance, Report on Azerbaijan (5th monitoring cycle), CoE Doc. CRI(2016)17 (7 June 2016), p. 21, ¶38.

monument, victory at a sports competition etc., anti-Armenian hate speech is the integral inalienable part of the speeches of the Azerbaijani authorities.

Such statements made on the highest political level have the effect of establishing and creating animosity and an atmosphere of hatred. Especially in a country where the media and internet are largely controlled by the government¹¹ hate speech and anti-Armenian statements made by the President and other high level authorities have significant impact and they inevitably form the negative climate in the country.

All these are in contradiction with the State's obligations under the CERD. In particular, the above statements and actions of the Azerbaijani authorities are in clear violation of the rule set forth in Article 4 of the Convention, according to which "*States Parties condemn all propaganda ... which attempt to justify or promote racial hatred and discrimination in any form, and undertake to adopt immediate and positive measures designed to eradicate all incitement to, or acts of, such discrimination.*" They are also in breach of the particular rule described under paragraph (c) of Article 4, which stipulates that States parties to the CERD "*[s]hall not permit public authorities or public institutions, national or local, to promote or incite racial discrimination.*"

As the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination has clarified in its General Recommendation XV and General Recommendation VII, the obligations provided under CERD, Article 4, are of a mandatory character.¹² The Committee has further highlighted that "*[t]o satisfy these obligations, States parties have not only to enact appropriate legislation but also to ensure that it is effectively enforced*" (emphasis added).¹³

The failure of Azerbaijan to comply with these obligations under CERD has been manifested on various government levels on multiple occasions.

Statements of the high political leadership of Azerbaijan inciting ethnic hatred towards Armenians are also in breach of the all-inclusive positive obligations set forth under Article 2 of CERD, in particular the general obligation to "*condemn racial discrimination,*" the general undertaking "*to pursue by all appropriate means and without delay a policy of [...] promoting understanding among all races,*" as well as particular undertakings under paragraph (a) of the same Article "*to ensure that all public authorities and public institutions, national and local, [...] act in conformity with this obligation.*"

¹¹ See the Freedom House Report, available at: <http://www.freedomhouse.org/country/azerbaijan> or Human Rights Watch assessment, available at: <http://www.hrw.org/news/2012/05/03/azerbaijan-media-freedoms-grave-danger>

¹² Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination, General Recommendation VII Relating to the Implementation of Article 4: Legislation to Eradicate Racial Discrimination, U.N. Doc. A/40/18 (23 August 1985), ¶1; Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination, General Recommendation XV on Article 4 of the Convention, U.N. Doc. A/48/18 (17 March 1993), ¶2.

¹³ General Recommendation XV, *ibid.*

3.2 Armenophobia in the Azerbaijani Media, failure to prevent

Section 2.3 above addressed, inter alia, how anti-Armenian sentiments have been propagated also by the Azerbaijani media. The important role that media may play in spreading hate speech and discrimination, thus, has been recognized by international courts and tribunals. The International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda indicated in its Prosecutor v. Nahimana et al. judgment as follows:

Within this norm of customary law [prohibiting discrimination], the prohibition of advocacy of discrimination and incitement to violence is increasingly important as the power of the media to harm is increasingly acknowledged.¹

That expression of racist ideas by journalists is in itself contradictory to the standards of the freedom of speech is granted, an important question here is the extent to which the media is allowed to disseminate and cover ideas of others which are discriminatory in their nature. Thus, in *Jersild v. Denmark*, while assessing the permissibility of limitations upon the freedom of speech imposed by a State, the ECHR indicated as follows:

Bearing in mind the obligations on States under the UN Convention and other international instruments to take effective measures to eliminate all forms of racial discrimination and to prevent and combat racist doctrines and practices [...], an important factor in the Court's evaluation will be whether the item in question, when considered as a whole, appeared from an objective point of view to have had as its purpose the propagation of racist views and ideas.²

¹ See: Prosecutor v. Nahimana et al., Case no. ICTR-99-52-T, Judgment and Sentence (3 December 2003), ¶1076.

² See e.g.: *Jersild v. Denmark*, Application no. 15890, GC Judgment of 23 September 1994, ¶31.

As the practice of international courts and tribunals reveals the dividing line between the permissible dissemination of information, whether it refers to practices that may be frowned upon by the international community or not, is the intent of the publisher. The ICTR sums up the practice in the following way:

In determining the scope of this responsibility, the importance of intent, that is the purpose of the communications they channel, emerges from the jurisprudence - whether or not the purpose in publicly transmitting the material was of a bona fide nature (e.g. historical research, the dissemination of news and information, the public accountability of government authorities).³

The motivation and the intention of the subject may for example be deduced from the words used. For example, in *Robert Faurisson v. France* communication, one of the chief factors that was decisive for the determination by the Human Rights Committee that there was no violation in the freedom of speech was the language used. Use of phrases such as “magic gas chambers” were sufficient to rebut any ostensible claim for purported historical discourse.⁴

In *Jersild v. Denmark* an important factor was that the Applicant, who was subject to criminal liability for making a report on the activities of a racist group in Denmark, did dissociate himself from the subjects that were covered in the report. Thus, the decision of the Danish courts was not upheld by the ECHR.⁵

However, as it can be seen from the excerpts in the first section, the Azerbaijani media in general does not dissociate itself from the racist remarks spread by the State officials and the political leadership. To the contrary, the media in itself operates as a tool of furious anti-Armenian propaganda machine.

The failure of the Azerbaijani state to prevent the dissemination of anti-Armenian propaganda is further in breach of the CERT, which prohibits the propaganda of hatred and animosity against a group. Below are the exact provisions applicable in this instance.

Under Article 4 of the Convention:

States parties condemn all propaganda and all organizations, which are based on the ideas or theories of superiority of one race or group of persons of one colour or ethnic origin, or which attempt to justify or promote racial hatred and discrimination in any form, and undertake to adopt immediate and positive measures designed to eradicate all incitement to, or acts of, such discrimination and, to this end, with due regard to principles embodied in the Universal Declaration of Human

³ See: *Prosecutor v. Nahimana et al.*, Case no. ICTR-99-52-T, Judgment and Sentence (3 December 2003), ¶1001.

⁴ See: *Robert Faurisson v. France*, Communication no. 550/1993, U.N. Doc. CCPR/C/58/D/550/1993 (2 January 1993).

⁵ See e.g.: *Jersild v. Denmark*, Application no. 15890, GC Judgment of 23 September 1994, ¶33.

| Rights and the Rights expressly set forth in article 5 of this Convention.

Article 4 enshrines an important obligation for condemning all propaganda and all organizations which are based on the idea of superiority of one race or group of persons. The important part of this article is that it obliges states also to condemn the propaganda and those organizations which attempt to justify or promote racial hatred.⁶ The three kinds of obligations enshrined in Article 4 are: a) to punish dissemination of racist ideas, incitement to racial discrimination, racist violence and activities; b) to declare illegal racist organization and propaganda; c) to prevent official bodies in engaging into racial discrimination.⁷

Under Article 7 of the Convention:

States parties undertake to adopt immediate and effective measures, particularly in the fields of teaching, education, culture and information, with a view to combating prejudices which lead to racial discrimination and to promoting understanding, tolerance and friendship among nations and racial or ethnical groups, as well as to propagating the purposes and principles of the Charter of the United Nations, the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, the United National Declaration on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, and this Convention.

Thus Azerbaijan has the following obligations stemming out from Convention: to prohibit and to punish all the acts of racial discrimination carried out by different media organizations and media, and to establish effectively an atmosphere which is compatible with the object and purpose of the Convention, i.e. promoting tolerance, understanding and peaceful coexistence of different groups. The obligation to establish a tolerant climate inter alia includes steps in education and teaching, i.e. educating the younger generation in spirit of tolerance and humanism, as well as preventing different individuals and groups from carrying out propaganda against a group, etc. However, as it is evidenced blow by different examples, Azerbaijan takes virtually no step to comply with its obligations under articles 4 and 7 of the Convention.

In Azerbaijan the media and internet are largely controlled by the government.⁸ The fact that the media and internet in Azerbaijan are mostly under Governmental control and censorship⁹ leads to the conclusion that the hatred, animosity, racism and xenophobia expressed in the media are, at the very least, carried out by the knowledge and permission of relevant governmental

⁶ <http://www.freedomhouse.org/country/azerbaijan> at 48.

⁷ Ibid at 49.

⁸ See the Freedom House Report available at: <http://www.freedomhouse.org/country/azerbaijan> or Human Rights Watch assessment, available at: <http://www.hrw.org/news/2012/05/03/azerbaijan-media-freedom-danger>

⁹ See e.g.: Report on Azerbaijan by Reporters without Borders available at: <http://en.rsf.org/report-azerbaijan.91.html>, where Azerbaijan was ranked 162 out of 179 in the latest worldwide index; see also assessment by Human Rights Watch- Azerbaijan: Concerns Regarding Freedom of the Media and Freedom of Expression. Available at: <http://www.hrw.org/news/2012/11/02/azerbaijan-concerns-regarding-freedom-media-and-freedom-expression> or Azerbaijan: Shrinking Space for Media Freedom, at: <http://www.hrw.org/news/2012/11/02/azerbaijan-shrinking-space-media-freedom>

authorities (if not directly attributable to them), which is more than sufficient for the determination that the state does not comply with its obligations under CERD and other international instruments. Oppressed press, prohibition of political pluralism demonstrate totally nondemocratic values of the country, which do not allow people to have views which may not coincide with the governmental one.¹⁰

The negative climate, racism and racial discrimination against Armenians are evidenced through numerous statements and speeches in the media. In particular, internet media is full of articles, statements, stories, news and other materials which have the only aim of spreading hatred and animosity against Armenia and Armenians in general. It sustains and increases the negative climate within the society towards Armenians, by constantly inciting hatred against them. The instances and examples of anti-Armenian racist propaganda in the internet media are summarize below. All the links used in the references contain the snapshots of initial source web-pages, however the initial source is indicated if it still working.

Another line of publications name and shame those Azerbaijanis, who have any connection with Armenians. For example, an article announces that it has been revealed that grandmother of a member of parliament of Azerbaijan is Armenian, or a military is being shamed, because his wife is Armenian, or an Azerbaijani artist is publicly subjected to a moral admonition for singing mugham (Azerbaijani national song) in accompaniment of an Armenian singer.¹¹

The vast majority of the indicated publications have the aim of spoiling the reputation of an individual. In some cases, the victims of such publications have come up with statements rejecting the information about their Armenian connections or ancestry.

And vice versa, the publications in the internet and media praise those Azerbaijanis who demonstrated the main-stream attitude of the Azerbaijani society towards Armenians.

Thus, as described above the Azerbaijani media and internet are full of hatred, racism and xenophobia against Armenians.

Articles, interviews, statements, views represent the overall negative climate that is persistent in the public. The public is fuelled with hate speeches and statements made by the President of Azerbaijan, as described above.

The fact that the media and internet in Azerbaijan are mostly under Governmental control and censorship allows us to come to conclusion that the

hatred, animosity, racism and xenophobia expressed in the media is carried out, at least, by the knowledge and permission of relevant governmental authorities, which is more than sufficient for attributing the conduct of the media to the state.

Many of the acts discussed, although performed by private individuals and different organizations are in fact attributable to the State of Azerbaijan. Thus, according to the International Law Commission's Articles on State Responsibility conduct shall be "considered an act of [a] State under international law if and to the extent that the State acknowledges and adopts the conduct in question as its own." This rule was applied by the International Court of Justice in the 1980 judgment in the United States Diplomatic and Consular Staff in Tehran case, concerning Iran's responsibility for not preventing militants from overrunning the US diplomatic premises and taking the personnel hostage.

In that case Iran was not only found responsible for its failure to protect the diplomatic premises, but according to the International Court of Justice, the public approval granted to the acts of the militants by the "organs of the Iranian State, and the decision to perpetuate them, translated continuing occupation of the Embassy and detention of the hostages into acts of that State." That approval took the form of public statements coming from numerous Iranian authorities and the religious leader Ayatollah Khomeini, who in particular stated that the "Iranian nation will not give permission for the release of [hostages]."

In this particular instance, the hate speech by high political leaders of Azerbaijan evidences that the racist and xenophobic acts carried out by different individuals and organizations, though private, constitute the conduct of Azerbaijan as a state. Hence, it is evident that Azerbaijan has consistently violated its obligations under articles 4 and 7 of CERD and other international instruments prohibiting discrimination.

¹⁰ Freedom House Report on Azerbaijan available at: <http://www.freedomhouse.org/template.cfm?page=22&year=2009&country=7560>

¹¹ Бабушка Гюльнар Ахмедовой армянка... ; Жена Армянка и беспредел в бравой армии; Народная артистка Азербайджана Ильхама Гулиева отказалась от знакомства с популярной турецкой певицей, у которой супруг армянин ; Народные артисты осудили азербайджанку.

See e.g.: Report on Azerbaijan by Reporters without Borders available at: <http://en.rsf.org/report-azerbaijan.91.html>, where Azerbaijan was ranked 162 out of 179 in the latest worldwide index; see also assessment by Human Rights Watch- Azerbaijan: Concerns Regarding Freedom of the Media and Freedom of Expression. Available at: <http://www.hrw.org/news/2012/11/02/azerbaijan-concerns-regarding-freedom-media-and-freedom-expression> or Azerbaijan: Shrinking Space for Media Freedom, at: <http://www.hrw.org/news/2012/11/02/azerbaijan-shrinking-space-media-freedom>

The Office of Artsakh Republic Human Rights Defender (Ombudsman) was established in **2008**, under the **Artsakh Republic Law “On the Human Rights Defender”** of February 9, 2005.



Ruben Melikyan, Human Rights Defender of Artsakh Republic

The First Artsakh Ombudsman was Yuri Hayrapetyan, serving from 2008 to 2016.

The incumbent is **Ruben Melikyan**, who was elected by Artsakh National Assembly on May 5, 2016 by a secret ballot.

The Office of Artsakh Ombudsman is based in Shushi, a town close to the capital of Artsakh, Stepanakert.

-  Postal address: 28 Hakhumyan st., Shushi, Artsakh
-  Telephone: +374 47736006
-  E-mail: info@ombudsnr.am
-  Website: www.ombudsnr.am
-  Facebook: www.facebook.com/ArtsakhOmbudsman
-  Twitter: [@nkr_ombudsman](https://twitter.com/nkr_ombudsman)

